



10.12.2018

REPORT

on EU Guidelines and the mandate of the EU Special Envoy on the promotion of freedom of religion or belief outside the EU
(2018/2155(INI))

Committee on Foreign Affairs

Rapporteur: Andrzej Grzyb

CONTENTS

	Page
MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION	3
INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE	13
FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE.....	14

MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION

on EU Guidelines and the mandate of the EU Special Envoy on the promotion of freedom of religion or belief outside the EU (2018/2155(INI))

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the international legal protection of freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief guaranteed by Article 18 of the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), Article 18 of the 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), the 1981 Declaration on the Elimination of all Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination based on Religion or Belief, Article 9 of the European Convention on Human Rights and Articles 10, 21 and 22 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union,
- having regard to the United Nations Human Rights Council's Comment No 22 of 30 July 1993 on Article 18 of the 1948 UDHR and to its Resolution 16/18 of 12 April 2011 on combating intolerance, negative stereotyping and stigmatisation of, and discrimination, incitement to violence and violence against, persons based on religion or belief,
- having regard to the Treaty on European Union, in particular Articles 2 and 21 thereof,
- having regard to Article 21 of the Treaty on European Union,
- having regard to Article 17 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,
- having regard to the Council conclusions of 21 February 2011 on intolerance, discrimination and violence on the basis of religion or belief,
- having regard to the EU Strategic Framework and Action Plan on Human Rights and Democracy, adopted on 25 June 2012 by the Council, and the 2015-2019 EU Action Plan on Human Rights and Democracy,
- having regard to the EU Guidelines of 24 June 2013 on the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief,
- having regard to its recommendation of 13 June 2013 on the draft EU Guidelines on the Promotion and Protection of Freedom of Religion or Belief¹,
- having regard to its resolutions of 20 January 2011 on the situation of Christians in the context of freedom of religion², 4 February 2016 on the systematic mass murder of religious minorities by the so-called 'ISIS/Daesh'³, and 14 December 2017 on the situation of the Rohingya people⁴,

¹ OJ C 65, 19.2.2016, p. 174.

² OJ C 136E, 11.5.2012, p. 53.

³ Texts adopted, P8_TA(2016)0051.

⁴ Texts adopted, P8_TA(2017)0500.

- having regard to its resolution of 9 July 2015 on ‘The EU’s new approach to human rights and democracy – evaluating the activities of the European Endowment for Democracy (EED) since its establishment’¹, and in particular its paragraphs 27 and 28,
 - having regard to its resolutions of 14 December 2016² and 23 November 2017³, respectively on the Annual Reports for 2015 and 2016 on human rights and democracy in the world and the European Union’s policy on the matter, with regard to 2015 in particular paragraph 14 of the 2016 resolution, and with regard to 2016 in particular paragraph 8 of the 2017 resolution,
 - having regard to the Rabat Plan of Action, published on 5 October 2012 by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), on the prohibition of advocacy of national, racial or religious hatred that constitutes incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence,
 - having regard to the mandate of the Special Envoy on the promotion of freedom of thought, conscience and religion outside the EU,
 - having regard to Regulation (EU) No 235/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 March 2014 establishing a financing instrument for democracy and human rights worldwide⁴,
 - having regard to the Council conclusions of 19 May 2014 on a rights-based approach to development cooperation, encompassing all human rights, and to the Commission staff working document of 30 April 2014 entitled ‘Tool-box – A rights-based approach encompassing all human rights for EU development cooperation’ (SWD(2014)0152),
 - having regard to the granting of the European Parliament Sakharov Prize for Freedom of Thought to Saudi blogger and activist Raif Badawi in 2015 for his remarkable efforts to foster open discussion of religion and politics in his country; having regard to his continued detention following his sentencing to 10 years in jail, a thousand lashes and a large fine for supposedly ‘insulting Islam’,
 - having regard to the case of the Pakistani Christian woman Asia Bibi, who was imprisoned and sentenced to death for blasphemy, and to her recent acquittal,
 - having regard to Rule 52 of its Rules of Procedure,
 - having regard to the report of the Committee on Foreign Affairs (A8-0449/2018),
- A. whereas freedom of thought, conscience, religion and belief, as referred to commonly within the EU framework and in this resolution, as the right to freedom of religion or belief (FoRB) is a human right inherent to all human beings and a fundamental right of individuals on a par with all others, which should be subjected to no kind of discrimination, as enshrined by international and European founding texts, including the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the European Convention on Human Rights

¹ Texts adopted, P8_TA(2015)0274.

² Texts adopted, P8_TA(2016)0502.

³ Texts adopted, P8_TA(2017)0494.

⁴ OJ L 77, 15.3.2014, p. 85.

and the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union; whereas everyone has the right to respect for all human rights enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights, without discrimination on grounds of race, ethnicity, ability, gender, sexual orientation, religious beliefs or absence of religious beliefs; whereas, under Article 21 of the Treaty on European Union, the Union's actions on the international scene shall be guided by the principles that have led to its creation; whereas, under Article 2 of the Treaty, the Union is founded on societies in which pluralism and tolerance prevail;

- B. whereas the principle of the separation of church and state is a prime constitutional principle worldwide and in Europe;
- C. whereas the European Parliament has defined secularism as strict separation between religious and political authority, which implies rejection of any religious interference in the functioning of public institutions and of any public interference in religious affairs, except to uphold the rules governing the preservation of public safety and order (including respect for the freedom of others) and to guarantee to all, whether believers, agnostics or atheists, the same freedom of conscience;
- D. whereas FoRB implies the right of the individual to choose what to believe or not to believe, the right to change or abandon one's religion and convictions without any constraints, and the right to practise and manifest the thought, conscience, religion and belief of one's choice, whether individually or in community and whether in private or in public; whereas the manifestation of thought, conscience, religion or belief can be expressed in worship, observance, practice and teaching; whereas FoRB entails the right of believers' and non-believers' communities to preserve or quit their ethos and to act in accordance with it, and the entitlement for religious, secular and non-confessional organisations to have recognised legal personality; whereas protecting individuals adhering to any religion or none and effectively addressing violations of FoRB, such as discrimination or legal restrictions based on religion or belief, are primordial conditions to ensure that individuals may enjoy FoRB on an equal basis;
- E. whereas theistic, non-theistic and atheistic beliefs, as well as the right not to profess any religion or belief are also protected under Article 18 ICCPR; whereas holding or not holding a religion or belief is an absolute right and may not be limited under any circumstances;
- F. whereas all human rights and fundamental freedoms are indivisible, interdependent and interrelated; whereas FoRB includes and is dependent on elements of many other human rights and fundamental freedoms, such as freedom of expression and freedom of assembly and association, and together plays an important role in the fight against all forms of intolerance and discrimination based on religion or belief;
- G. whereas freedom of religion must cease at the point where its practice would violate the rights and freedoms of others, and whereas the practice of a religion or pursuit of a conviction can never, under any pretext, justify violent extremism or mutilation, nor can it give anyone free rein to act in ways detrimental to the inherent dignity of the individual;
- H. whereas respect for FoRB directly contributes to democracy, development, the rule of

law, peace and stability; whereas violations of FoRB are widespread, affect people in all parts of the world, encroach on the dignity of human life, and give rise to or exacerbate intolerance, often constituting early indicators of potential violence and conflicts; whereas states must exercise due diligence to prevent, investigate and punish acts of violence, or the threat thereof, against persons based on their religion or belief, as well as ensuring accountability should such violations occur;

- I. whereas according to Article 21 TEU, the EU promotes and defends the universality and indivisibility of human rights and fundamental freedoms and respect for human dignity as part of the guiding principles of its foreign policy;
- J. whereas religious restrictions and antagonisms, generated by governments or societies, still persist in many countries; whereas certain religious minorities have faced heightened threats and persecution from state and non-state actors; whereas human rights defenders around the world fighting for FoRB are coming under increasing threat and attack;
- K. whereas, in pursuit of the objective of advancing freedom of thought, conscience and religion through the EU's foreign policy, the Council adopted in June 2013 the EU Guidelines on the promotion and protection of freedom of freedom of thought, conscience and religion, and in May 2016, the Commission appointed the first Special Envoy for the promotion of freedom of thought, conscience and religion outside the EU, for a one-year mandate which has since been twice renewed on a yearly basis;
- L. whereas the EU has promoted FoRB, at international level and through multilateral fora, in particular by taking the lead on thematic resolutions on FoRB in the UN General Assembly (UNGA) and the UN Human Rights Council (UNHRC) and supporting the mandate of and engaging with the UN Special Rapporteur on FoRB, but also through cooperation with like-minded third countries;
- M. whereas the promotion of freedom of thought, conscience and religion, including through civil society support for the protection of the rights of believers and non-believers and those of individuals belonging to religious and belief minorities in particular, support for human rights defenders (HRDs) and the fight against discrimination on grounds of religion or belief, and the promotion of intercultural and interreligious dialogue, represent a funding priority under the 2014-2020 European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights (EIDHR); whereas the European Development Fund (EDF) and EU financial instruments such as the Development Cooperation Instrument (DCI), the European Neighbourhood Instrument (ENI), the Instrument contributing to Stability and Peace (IcSP) and the Instrument for Pre-Accession Assistance (IPA) have also supported projects that are conducive to improving the environment for freedom of thought, conscience and religion;
- 1. Stresses that freedom of thought, conscience, religion and belief, as commonly referred to within the EU framework and in this resolution, as freedom of religion or belief (FoRB), is a universal human right, a value of the EU and an important and undeniable pillar of dignity, greatly impacting on all individuals, their personal identity and development and on societies; underlines that individuals must be allowed the freedom to organise their personal life in accordance with their own convictions; stresses that the right to FoRB includes the rights not to believe, to espouse theistic, non-theistic,

agnostic or atheistic views and the right to apostasy; affirms that FoRB must be duly protected, promoted and safeguarded by all actors as well as enhanced through interreligious and intercultural dialogue, in line with Article 18 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the values of the European Union as laid down in the TEU and the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights; underscores the duty of states to guarantee FoRB and treat all individuals equally, without any discrimination based on religion or belief, in order to preserve peaceful, democratic and pluralistic societies that are respectful of diversity and beliefs;

2. Expresses its deep concern that recent years have seen a dramatic rise in violations of FoRB worldwide and persecution of believers and non-believers; condemns the instrumentalisation of religious issues for political ends, and violence, harassment or social pressures against any individual or group of people on grounds of thought, conscience, religion or belief; condemns persecution of and attacks against ethnic, and religious groups, non-believers, atheists and any other minorities, and persecution of women and girls, and of individuals based on their sexual orientation; condemns forced conversions and harmful practices such as female genital mutilation, as well as forced marriages and certain other practices associated with or perceived as manifestations of a religion or belief, and calls for immediate accountability for such violations; stresses that violations of FoRB are frequently at the root of or increasingly exacerbate wars or other forms of armed conflict, resulting in violations of humanitarian law, including mass murders or genocide; stresses that violations of FoRB undermine democracy, impede development, and negatively affect the enjoyment of other fundamental freedoms and rights; emphasises that this obligates the international community, the EU and its Member States to reaffirm their determination and strengthen their actions in promoting FoRB for all;
3. Stresses that, in accordance with Article 21 TEU, the EU and its Member States have pledged to enhance respect for human rights, as a principle guiding EU foreign policy; strongly welcomes the fact that the 2013 EU Guidelines mainstream the promotion and protection of FoRB into EU foreign policy and external actions, and in this regard calls for further strengthening activities aimed at awareness-raising and implementation of the Guidelines;
4. Stresses that, in accordance with Article 17 TFEU, the EU is committed to maintaining open, transparent and regular dialogue with churches and with religious, philosophical and non-confessional organisations; highlights the effects of these dialogues with regard to respect for other human rights; stresses that such interreligious and intercultural dialogues are often met by greater openness by some of the EU's international partners and create a starting-point for progress in other areas;
5. Stresses the importance of reaching out to non-believers in countries where they cannot organise and cannot benefit from freedom of assembly;

EU strategy to promote and protect FoRB through international relations and cooperation

6. Welcomes the enhancement of the promotion of FoRB in EU foreign policy and external actions over recent years, in particular through the EU Global Strategy for foreign policy and security and the 2015-2019 EU Action Plan on Human Rights and Democracy; welcomes the fact that this enhancement is being met with an increased

commitment on the part of many partner countries to comply with the respective Articles 18 of the UDHR and ICCPR;

7. Takes note of the creation of the post of Special Envoy for the promotion of FoRB outside the EU in 2016 by the President of the Commission, in response to the resolution of Parliament of 4 February 2016; considers the appointment of the Special Envoy as an important step forward and a clear recognition of FoRB within the human rights agenda of EU foreign policy and external actions, both bilateral and multilateral, and within development cooperation; encourages the Special Envoy to continue his engagement and cooperation and complementarity of actions with the EU Special Representative for Human Rights on this issue, including the promotion of the EU Guidelines; positively notes the active support of the Commissioner on International Cooperation and Development and DG DEVCO for the Special Envoy;
8. Stresses the importance of linking up efforts to promote FoRB and inter- and intra-religious, interfaith, inter-convictional, intercultural and interphilosophical dialogues with the prevention of religious extremism on a complementary and mutually reinforcing basis, as a way to uphold freedom of religion and belief in the world, in particular within neighbouring and other countries with which the EU has special relations; underlines that non-confessional, humanist and secular organisations also play a key role in preventing religious extremism;
9. Calls for increased cooperation to prevent persecution of minorities on grounds of thought, conscience, religion or belief, to create conditions for peaceful coexistence in societies marked by diversity, and to ensure ongoing dialogue between religious leaders and actors, scholars, churches and other faith-based organisations, non-believers' groups, national human rights institutions, human rights defenders, women's rights and youth organisations, civil society representatives and the media; calls on the EEAS and the EU Delegations to identify with their various interlocutors a set of common objectives to advance FoRB through human rights dialogue;
10. Considers that religious illiteracy, as well as the lack of knowledge and recognition of the role that religions play for a large part of humankind, fuel bias and stereotypes that contribute to increase tensions, misunderstanding and disrespectful and unfair treatment related to attitudes and behaviour of large parts of the population; stresses the importance of education for preserving and building FoRB worldwide and fighting intolerance; calls on those in positions of responsibility in communications media and social media to contribute positively and respectfully to public debates, avoiding negative biases and stereotypes towards religions and believers, and to exercise their freedom of expression in a responsible manner as required by Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights;
11. Deplores the fact that some countries have, enforce or seek to introduce penal laws providing for the punishment of blasphemy, conversion or apostasy, including the death penalty; deplores the fact that these laws aim generally to limit FoRB and freedom of expression and are often used as a form of oppression of minorities, as well as of political oppression; also draws attention to the situation of some other countries facing or being at risk of conflicts in which religious issues are a driver or are instrumentalised; calls for the EU to increase its political commitment to prioritise in its foreign policy

efforts towards all countries concerned with a view to the repeal of such discriminatory laws and putting an end to the repression of human rights defenders and the shrinking of civil society space on religious grounds; urges the EU to include a human rights dialogue covering respect for FoRB in all negotiations undertaken with a view to the conclusion of any agreements with non-EU countries;

12. Condemns the continued detention of Sakharov Prize laureate Raif Badawi after an unlawful trial, and urges the Saudi authorities to proceed to his immediate and unconditional release;
13. Calls on the Pakistani authorities to secure the safety of Asia Bibi and her family;

Special Envoy for the promotion of freedom of religion or belief outside the EU

14. Welcomes the fact that the Special Envoy has developed effective working networks within the Commission as well as with the Council, the European Parliament, and other stakeholders; calls on the Special Envoy to report annually on the countries visited and his thematic priorities;
15. Calls on the Council and the Commission to carry out a transparent and comprehensive assessment of the effectiveness and added value of the position of the Special Envoy in the process of the renewal of his or her mandate; calls on the Council and the Commission, on the basis of this assessment, to adequately support the Special Envoy's institutional mandate, capacity and duties, by exploring the possibility of a multi-year term subjected to annual review and by developing working networks within all relevant EU institutions;
16. Stresses that the Special Envoy's duties should focus on promoting freedom of thought, conscience, religion and belief, and the rights to non-belief, apostasy and the espousal of atheistic views, also paying attention to the situation of non-believers at risk; recommends that the role of the Special Envoy could include competences such as: enhancing the visibility, effectiveness, coherence and accountability of the EU's FoRB policy outside the EU; providing the European Parliament, the Council, the Vice-President of the Commission / High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security and the Commission with an annual progress report and a comprehensive report on the Special Envoy's mandate at the end thereof; and working in close cooperation with the Council Working Group on Human Rights (COHOM);
17. Commends the work done by the EU Special Representative for Human Rights, including on FoRB; stresses that when developing institutional mandates it is important to avoid duplication of duties and competences between the Special Envoy and the EU Special Representative for Human Rights;
18. Notes that a number of Member States have recently created new posts of responsibility for FoRB, whose role is akin to the Special Envoy's; underscores the need for a consistent approach that encompasses the rights of all religious communities as well as non-believers; encourages cooperation between the Special Envoy and the national officials in charge of FoRB outside their country, as well as with COHOM and the European Parliament; calls for enhanced cooperation and joint and mutual effort

between the EU Delegations and the Member States' embassies, in order to ensure a consistent and united voice in the promotion of FoRB outside the EU and support communities and individuals facing violations of FoRB;

19. Recommends considering the possibility of setting up an informal advisory working group consisting of representatives of Member States' FoRB and other relevant institutions as well as European Parliament representatives and experts, scholars and representatives of civil society, including churches and other faith-based organisations as well as non-confessional organisations;
20. Recommends that the Special Envoy further develop cooperation with counterparts outside the EU, in particular by working in close cooperation with and supporting the work of the EU Special Representative for Human Rights and the different UN Special Rapporteurs and in particular the rapporteur on FoRB, as well as exploring the possibility of EU-UN joint initiatives on discrimination against religious groups and minorities as well as non-believers and people who change religion or criticise or leave a religion, also formulating common proposals on how to put an end to such discrimination; notes the proposal to establish an official annual UN-led international day commemorating the victims and survivors of religious persecution;

EU Guidelines on the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief

21. Considers that the EU Guidelines present a clear set of political lines, principles, norms and themes for priority actions, as well as a toolkit for monitoring, assessing, reporting and démarches by EU representatives in third countries, that constitute a solid strategic approach for the EU and its Member States enabling them to exert an effective role in promoting freedom of thought, conscience and religion outside the EU;
22. Calls as a matter of urgency for the effective implementation of the EU Guidelines on FoRB in order to make the EU more influential in advancing FoRB worldwide; stresses that understanding how societies may be shaped and influenced by ideas, religions and other forms of culture and belief, including non-belief, is instrumental to better comprehending the promotion of FoRB in EU foreign policy and international cooperation; calls for equal attention to be paid to the situation of non-believers, atheists and apostates facing persecution, discrimination and violence;
23. Calls for the strengthening of knowledge on FoRB and welcomes, in this respect, the efforts made to date by the EEAS and the Commission to provide training in the area of literacy in and history of religion and belief as well as on the situation of religious minorities and non-believers to EU officials and national diplomats, while respecting the principles of pluralism and neutrality; stresses, however, the need for broader and more systematic training programmes which would raise awareness of and increase the use of the EU Guidelines among the EU's and Member States' officials and diplomats and strengthen cooperation with the Special Envoy; recommends that academics, churches and religious communities and associations in their full diversity, as well as non-confessional organisations, human rights and civil society organisations, be involved in this training process; calls on the Commission and the Council to provide adequate resources to such training programmes;
24. Calls on the Commission and the EEAS to ensure a FoRB-dedicated chapter in the EU

Annual Reports on Human Rights and Democracy in the World, as well as progress reports in respect of the implementation of the EU Guidelines, to be communicated to Parliament and the Council; notes that the EU Guidelines provide for an evaluation of their implementation by COHOM after a period of three years, and that no such evaluation has been communicated or made public; calls for the evaluation to be made public without delay; considers that the evaluation should highlight best practices, identify areas for improvement, and provide concrete recommendations on implementation, in accordance with a specified timeline and milestones and subject to regular annual evaluation; calls for the evaluation to be included in the EU Annual Reports on Human Rights and Democracy in the World;

25. Underlines the responsibilities fulfilled by human rights focal points, including in relation to FoRB, within all EU Delegations and CSDP Missions; calls for adequate resources to be allocated to those delegations and missions so as to allow them to carry out their work of monitoring, assessing and reporting human rights situations of concern, including those relating to respect for FoRB;
26. Recalls the importance of the Human Rights and Democracy Country Strategies (HRDCSs), which tailor EU action to each country's specific situation and needs; calls for adequate attention to be paid to issues related to freedom of thought, conscience and religion, with lines for EU action being drawn up so that they can be tackled under the HRDCSs wherever respect for freedom of thought, conscience and religion is endangered; reiterates its call for Members of the European Parliament to be given access to the content of HRDCSs;

EU actions on freedom of thought, conscience and religion in multilateral fora

27. Welcomes the EU commitment to promoting FoRB in multilateral fora, in particular within the UN, the Council of Europe and the OSCE and with the Organisation of Islamic Cooperation (OIC); supports, in this respect, EU cooperation with the UN Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief and the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights; recommends continuing the EU practice of taking the lead on resolutions in the UN General Assembly and the UN Human Rights Council on FoRB and seeking to build alliances and defend common positions with third countries and international organisations; calls on the EU and the OIC to consider preparing a joint resolution on FoRB within the UN framework;

EU financial instruments

28. Expresses its satisfaction that FoRB is identified as a priority of the European Instrument of Democracy and Human Rights (EIDHR); notes the increase of EIDHR funding allocated to FoRB-related projects since the adoption of the EU Guidelines; calls on the Commission and the EEAS to ensure that EU diplomatic work for the promotion of human rights, including FoRB and EIDHR-funded projects, is mutually reinforcing, and to respect the principles of pluralism, neutrality and fairness in allocating funds; stresses that FoRB can also be supported by other instruments than human rights-oriented funds, among others those dedicated to the conflict prevention dimension or to education and culture; calls on the Commission and the Council to maintain sufficient funding for FoRB-related projects under the EU external financial instruments, within the Multiannual Financial Framework (MFF) for 2021-2027; calls

for the EIDHR to be given the means to finance the protection or exfiltration of freethinkers and human rights activists who are threatened or persecuted in their country of origin;

29. Calls for an effort to ensure transparency in the allocation of funding and to monitor the use thereof by religions and their activities;
30. Stresses that the EU's policies in the fields of peace, security and conflict prevention and development and cooperation face challenges, for which solutions can be devised with the participation of, among others, churches, religious leaders, academics, religious and belief communities and associations and both faith-based and non-confessional organisations, all being an important part of civil society; acknowledges the importance of being mindful of the diversity of churches, religious and belief communities and associations and faith-based and non-confessional organisations which perform actual development and humanitarian work for and with communities; calls on the Council and the Commission to incorporate, where relevant, objectives and activities relating to the promotion and protection of FoRB into the programming of funding instruments linked to those policies, namely the EDF, the DCI, the ENI, the IcSP and the IPA, as well as any other instruments that may be set up in the relevant areas after 2020;
31. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission, the Vice-President of the Commission / High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy, the EEAS, the governments and parliaments of the Member States and the United Nations.

INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

Date adopted	6.12.2018
Result of final vote	+: 41 -: 1 0: 2
Members present for the final vote	Petras Auštrevičius, Elmar Brok, Klaus Buchner, Lorenzo Cesa, Aymeric Chauprade, Javier Couso Permuy, Georgios Epitideios, Eugen Freund, Michael Gahler, Iveta Grigule-Pēterse, Sandra Kalniete, Tunne Kelam, Wajid Khan, Andrey Kovatchev, Eduard Kukan, Ilhan Kyuchyuk, Arne Lietz, Barbara Lochbihler, Andrejs Mamikins, Ramona Nicole Mănescu, David McAllister, Tamás Meszerics, Clare Moody, Pier Antonio Panzeri, Demetris Papadakis, Alojz Peterle, Tonino Picula, Julia Pitera, Cristian Dan Preda, Jozo Radoš, Alyn Smith, Jordi Solé, László Tőkés, Anders Primdahl Vistisen
Substitutes present for the final vote	Asim Ademov, Tanja Fajon, Antonio López-Istúriz White, Marie-Christine Vergiat, Janusz Zemke, Željana Zovko
Substitutes under Rule 200(2) present for the final vote	John Howarth, Miroslav Mikolášik, Thomas Waitz, Bogdan Andrzej Zdrojewski

FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

41	+
ALDE	Petras Auštrevičius, Iveta Grigule-Pēterse, Ilhan Kyuchyuk, Jozo Radoš
ECR	Anders Primdahl Vistisen
EFDD	Aymeric Chauprade
PPE	Asim Ademov, Elmar Brok, Lorenzo Cesa, Michael Gahler, Sandra Kalniete, Tunne Kelam, Andrey Kovatchev, Eduard Kukan, Antonio López-Istúriz White, David McAllister, Miroslav Mikolášik, Ramona Nicole Mănescu, Alojz Peterle, Julia Pitera, Cristian Dan Preda, László Tőkés, Bogdan Andrzej Zdrojewski, Željana Zovko
S&D	Tanja Fajon, Eugen Freund, John Howarth, Wajid Khan, Arne Lietz, Andrejs Mamikins, Clare Moody, Pier Antonio Panzeri, Demetris Papadakis, Tonino Picula, Janusz Zemke
VERTS/ALE	Klaus Buchner, Barbara Lochbihler, Tamás Meszerics, Alyn Smith, Jordi Solé, Thomas Waitz

1	-
NI	Georgios Epitideios

2	0
GUE/NGL	Javier Couso Permuy, Marie-Christine Vergiat

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention