



2021/0218(COD)

22.4.2022

OPINION

of the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development

for the Committee on the Industry, Research and Energy

on the proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council amending Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council and Directive 98/70/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the promotion of energy from renewable sources, and repealing Council Directive (EU) 2015/652
(COM(2021)0557 – C9-0329/2021 – 2021/0218(COD))

Rapporteur for opinion: Pina Picierno

PA_Legam

SHORT JUSTIFICATION

The Rapporteur focuses on the interests of farmers and the agriculture sector in the EU when putting forward amendments in this Draft Opinion of the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development of the European Parliament on the proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council amending Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council and Directive 98/70/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the promotion of energy from renewable sources (RED III).

The Committee welcomes the increased level of ambition proposed by the Commission and is of the opinion that to meet those new targets, a general mobilisation will be needed, transforming this challenge into opportunities leaving no one behind, particularly in rural areas which are both at the forefront of the climate challenge and a source of solutions to fight climate change.

This Committee regularly considers the issue of food security within the European Union, and the draft opinion to RED III is written in that context. Raw materials from agriculture must primarily remain for food and feed uses so that the necessary imports to the EU for feed purposes can at least be kept stable, or reduced over time. For this purpose, it should be also underlined that the production of conventional biofuels is a major lever for the production of proteins, needed particularly for animal feed. Broadening the categories of energy feedstocks is a complex and sensitive question, which should be considered only when necessary in the Committee's Opinion.

RED II sets a clear framework, which is the basis on which many operators have made long-term investments and have legitimate expectations of maximum stability and consistency, whilst the need for sustainable energy grows. This, in the situation where our ambition is to reach 38% to 40% RES in our energy mix, and there is increasing pressure on the agriculture sector.

Whilst recognising the limited scope of the Commission's proposal, the need for stability, and the fact that the implementation of RED II is still in its early stages, the Rapporteur nevertheless considers that there are legitimate concerns, which were raised by this Committee in the last revision. Some of these are still pertinent, and should be further considered, including agricultural and crop waste as potential energy feedstocks.

Specific elements included in amendments are:

- ensuring use of waste heating and cooling on and from farms and agricultural holdings;
- ensuring that training for installers of renewable technologies fully covers the specific needs of agricultural buildings so that even the remotest areas have access to professionally skilled people;
- ensuring that renewable technologies are facilitated in remote rural areas in terms of integrating small scale or on-farm energy production and use of surplus energy;
- consideration of charging needs on agricultural holdings as numbers of electric agricultural vehicles increase;
- maintaining the current system of calculation for GHG reduction based on the NUTS II

- level in order to avoid extra administrative burden, especially for small farmers.
- ensuring adequate anti-fraud provisions and a full and certified traceability covering not only the biofuels but also the inputs used in their production.

In the draft opinion and the work towards the Committee's final opinion, the Rapporteur wishes to ensure that agriculture is not only fully taken into account in this amendment of the RED, but that it is also enabled to play a stronger role in increasing the proportion of renewables into the energy mix of the future, alongside its other essential functions of providing food and feed sustainably, and of safeguarding biodiversity.

AMENDMENTS

The Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development calls on the Committee on the Industry, Research and Energy, as the committee responsible, to take into account the following amendments:

Amendment 1

Proposal for a directive

Recital 1

Text proposed by the Commission

(1) The European Green Deal establishes⁵ the objective of the Union becoming climate neutral in 2050 in a manner that contributes to the European economy, growth and job creation. That objective, and the objective of a 55% reduction in greenhouse gas emissions by 2030 as set out in the 2030 Climate Target Plan⁶, that was endorsed both by the European Parliament⁷, and by the European Council⁸, requires *an* energy transition and significantly higher shares of renewable energy sources in an integrated energy system.

⁵ Communication from the Commission COM(2019) 640 final of 11.12.2019, The European Green Deal.

⁶ Communication from the Commission

Amendment

(1) The European Green Deal (EGD) establishes⁵ the objective of the Union becoming climate neutral in 2050 in a manner that contributes to the European economy, growth and jobs. That objective, and the objective of a 55% reduction in greenhouse gas emissions by 2030 as set out in the 2030 Climate Target Plan⁶ that was endorsed both by the European Parliament⁷ and by the European Council⁸, requires *a fair and equitable* energy transition, *so that no region is left behind, as well as* significantly higher shares of renewable energy sources in an integrated energy system.

⁵ Communication from the Commission COM(2019) 640 final of 11.12.2019, The European Green Deal.

⁶ Communication from the Commission

COM(2020) 562 final of 17.9.2020,
Stepping up Europe's 2030 climate
ambition - Investing in a climate-neutral
future for the benefit of our people.

⁷ European Parliament resolution of 15
January 2020 on the European Green Deal
[2019/2956(RSP)].

⁸ European Council conclusions of 11
December 2020,
<https://www.consilium.europa.eu/media/47296/1011-12-20-euco-conclusions-en.pdf>

COM(2020) 562 final of 17.9.2020,
Stepping up Europe's 2030 climate
ambition - Investing in a climate-neutral
future for the benefit of our people.

⁷ European Parliament resolution of 15
January 2020 on the European Green Deal
[2019/2956(RSP)].

⁸ European Council conclusions of 11
December 2020,
<https://www.consilium.europa.eu/media/47296/1011-12-20-euco-conclusions-en.pdf>

Amendment 2

Proposal for a directive Recital 2

Text proposed by the Commission

(2) Renewable energy plays a fundamental role in delivering the European Green Deal and for achieving climate neutrality by 2050, given that the energy sector contributes over 75% of total greenhouse gas emissions in the Union. By reducing those greenhouse gas emissions, renewable energy also contributes to tackling environmental-related challenges such as biodiversity loss.

Amendment

(2) Renewable energy plays a fundamental role in delivering the European Green Deal and for achieving climate neutrality by 2050, given that the energy sector contributes over 75% of total greenhouse gas emissions in the Union. By reducing those greenhouse gas emissions, renewable energy also contributes to tackling environmental-related challenges such as biodiversity loss. ***The low operating costs of renewable energy and the reduced exposure to price shocks compared to fossil fuels gives renewable energy a key role in tackling energy poverty.***

Amendment 3

Proposal for a directive Recital 2 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(2a) 31 million people live in energy poverty, with rural areas being particularly affected. Renewable energy can contribute to eradicating energy

poverty and thus strengthen the social component of the European Green Deal.

Amendment 4

Proposal for a directive Recital 3

Text proposed by the Commission

(3) Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council⁹ sets a binding Union target to reach a share of at least 32 % of energy from renewable sources in the Union's gross final consumption of energy by 2030. Under the Climate Target Plan, the share of renewable energy in gross final energy consumption would need to increase to **40%** by 2030 in order to achieve the Union's greenhouse gas emissions reduction target¹⁰. Therefore, the target set out in Article 3 of that Directive needs to be increased.

⁹ Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2018 on the promotion of the use of energy from renewable sources, OJ L 328, 21.12.2018, p. 82–209

¹⁰ Point 3 of the Communication from the Commission COM(2020) 562 final of 17.9.2020, Stepping up Europe's 2030 climate ambition Investing in a climate-neutral future for the benefit of our people

Amendment

(3) Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council⁹ sets a binding Union target to reach a share of at least 32 % of energy from renewable sources in the Union's gross final consumption of energy by 2030. Under the Climate Target Plan, the share of renewable energy in gross final energy consumption would need to increase to **45%** by 2030 in order to achieve the Union's greenhouse gas emissions reduction target¹⁰. Therefore, the target set out in Article 3 of that Directive needs to be increased.

⁹ Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2018 on the promotion of the use of energy from renewable sources, OJ L 328, 21.12.2018, p. 82–209

¹⁰ Point 3 of the Communication from the Commission COM(2020) 562 final of 17.9.2020, Stepping up Europe's 2030 climate ambition Investing in a climate-neutral future for the benefit of our people

Justification

Increasing production and consumption of renewable energy is fundamental to achieve the Union's greenhouse gas emission reduction target. While the Commission proposes ambitious transition of electricity production and cooling and heating, there is a potential lack of ambitions in terms of energy consumption in the transport sector. A higher overall target is necessary to include more ambitious strategies in all sectors.

Amendment 5

Proposal for a directive Recital 4

Text proposed by the Commission

(4) There is a growing recognition of the need for alignment of bioenergy policies with the cascading principle of biomass use¹¹, with a view to ensuring fair access to the biomass raw material market for the development of innovative, high value-added bio-based solutions and a sustainable circular bioeconomy. When developing support schemes for bioenergy, Member States should therefore take into consideration the available sustainable supply of biomass for energy and non-energy uses and the maintenance of the national forest carbon sinks and ecosystems as well as the principles of the circular economy and the biomass cascading use, and the waste hierarchy established in Directive 2008/98/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council¹². ***For this, they should grant no support to the production of energy from saw logs, veneer logs, stumps and roots and avoid promoting the use of quality roundwood for energy except in well-defined circumstances. In line with the cascading principle, woody biomass should be used according to its highest economic and environmental added value in the following order of priorities: 1) wood-based products, 2) extending their service life, 3) re-use, 4) recycling, 5) bio-energy and 6) disposal. Where no other use for woody biomass is economically viable or environmentally appropriate, energy recovery helps to reduce energy generation from non-renewable sources. Member States' support schemes for bioenergy should therefore be directed to such feedstocks for which little market competition exists with the material sectors, and whose sourcing is considered positive for both climate and biodiversity,***

Amendment

(4) There is a growing recognition of the need for alignment of bioenergy policies with the cascading principle of biomass use¹¹, ***and that the development of the bio-energy sector should respect the proximity principle, to ensure balanced regional development of the industry in which local populations retain control,*** with a view to ensuring fair access to the biomass raw material market for the development of innovative, high value-added bio-based solutions and a sustainable circular bioeconomy. When developing support schemes for bioenergy, Member States should therefore take into consideration the available sustainable supply of biomass for energy and non-energy uses and the maintenance of the national forest carbon sinks and ecosystems as well as the principles of the circular economy and the biomass cascading use, and the waste hierarchy established in Directive 2008/98/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council¹². On the other hand, in defining the further implications of the cascading principle, it is necessary to recognise the national specificities which guide Member States in the design of their support schemes. Waste prevention, reuse and recycling of waste should be the priority option. Member States should avoid creating support schemes which would be counter to targets on treatment of waste and which would lead to the inefficient use of recyclable waste.

in order to avoid negative incentives for unsustainable bioenergy pathways, as identified in the JRC report ‘The use of woody biomass for energy production in the EU’¹³. On the other hand, in defining the further implications of the cascading principle, it is necessary to recognise the national specificities which guide Member States in the design of their support schemes. Waste prevention, reuse and recycling of waste should be the priority option. Member States should avoid creating support schemes which would be counter to targets on treatment of waste and which would lead to the inefficient use of recyclable waste. Moreover, in order to ensure a more efficient use of bioenergy, from 2026 on Member States should not give support anymore to electricity-only plants, unless the installations are in regions with a specific use status as regards their transition away from fossil fuels or if the installations use carbon capture and storage.

¹¹ The cascading principle aims to achieve resource efficiency of biomass use through prioritising biomass material use to energy use wherever possible, increasing thus the amount of biomass available within the system. In line with the cascading principle, woody biomass should be used according to its highest economic and environmental added value in the following order of priorities: 1) wood-based products, 2) extending their service life, 3) re-use, 4) recycling, 5) bio-energy and 6) disposal.

¹² Directive 2008/98/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 19 November 2008 on waste and repealing certain Directives (OJ L 312, 22.11.2008, p. 3).

¹³

<https://publications.jrc.ec.europa.eu/repository/handle/JRC122719>

¹¹ The cascading principle aims to achieve resource efficiency of biomass use through prioritising biomass material use to energy use wherever possible, increasing thus the amount of biomass available within the system. In line with the cascading principle, woody biomass should be used according to its highest economic and environmental added value in the following order of priorities: 1) wood-based products, 2) extending their service life, 3) re-use, 4) recycling, 5) bio-energy and 6) disposal.

¹² Directive 2008/98/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 19 November 2008 on waste and repealing certain Directives (OJ L 312, 22.11.2008, p. 3).

¹³

<https://publications.jrc.ec.europa.eu/repository/handle/JRC122719>

Justification

The discrimination of certain categories of feedstock would complicate the application of the Risk-Based Approach and could require further additional and unnecessary steps for verification. The timeframe for REDII and REDIII is 2030, thus it makes sense to create a stable regulatory landscape for the duration of this period. Therefore, it is more coherent to allow the issuance of new support for electric only installations until 2030. In addition, there should be more protections provided to prevent the negative impacts from the discontinuation of support. These include the BECCS requirements. As BECCS has not yet become a mainstream technology and in order to support its scale up, support should be given to installations which can show a completed technology readiness assessment to prove CCS is possible on site and then if successful, support should be given to those sites that are actively implementing CCS as demonstrated by a pilot project. Finally, there also need to be protections in place to support the security of supply objective, which is necessary for the stability and integrity of the European Energy system even if there is not demand for heating. With an increasing share of intermittent renewable energy entering the market, sustainable biomass, acting as baseload, dispatchable fuel source, can provide important benefits to the grid such as flexibility, balancing, and security of supply. Hence, it will assist the EU in meeting both its climate goals while ensuring grid stability.

Amendment 6

Proposal for a directive Recital 4 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(4a) The role and contribution of carbon capture and storage to the renewable energy market should be fully realised and supported. Carbon in biomass has the potential to be converted into biochar through pyrolysis, which can then be stored by land application, thereby making it a negative emissions technology;

Justification

It is important to look at and acknowledge valuable side streams and by-products from bioenergy production. Via pyrolysis of plant material renewable energy can be produced together with a biochar that can store carbon. IPCC values biochar as an important carbon sink in their 2019 Refinement to the 2006 IPCC Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories.

Amendment 7

Proposal for a directive Recital 4 b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(4b) Agricultural residues for the production of biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels should be cultivated and harvested using practices that are consistent with the protection of soil quality and soil organic carbon.

Justification

Soil quality and soil organic carbon are central assets for mitigating climate change, and as such, no EU policy, in particular aiming at fighting climate change should lead to a degradation of soils.

Amendment 8

Proposal for a directive Recital 5

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(5) The rapid growth and increasing cost-competitiveness of renewable electricity production can be used to satisfy a growing share of energy demand, for instance using heat pumps for space heating or low-temperature industrial processes, electric vehicles for transport, or electric furnaces in certain industries. Renewable electricity can also be used to produce synthetic fuels for consumption in hard-to-decarbonise transport sectors such as aviation and maritime transport. A framework for electrification needs to enable robust and efficient coordination and expand market mechanisms to match both supply and demand in space and time, stimulate investments in flexibility, and help integrate large shares of variable renewable generation. Member States should therefore ensure that the

(5) The rapid growth and increasing cost-competitiveness of renewable electricity production can be used to satisfy a growing share of energy demand, for instance using heat pumps, ***solar panels and wind turbines*** for space heating or low-temperature industrial processes, electric vehicles for transport, ***agriculture wherever feasible***, or electric furnaces in certain industries. Renewable electricity can also be used to produce synthetic fuels for consumption in hard-to-decarbonise transport sectors such as aviation and maritime transport. A framework for electrification needs to enable robust and efficient coordination and expand market mechanisms to match both supply and demand in space and time, stimulate investments in flexibility, and help integrate large shares of variable renewable

deployment of renewable electricity continues to increase at an adequate pace to meet growing demand. For this, Member States should establish a framework that includes market-compatible mechanisms to tackle remaining barriers to have secure and adequate electricity systems fit for a high level of renewable energy, as well as storage facilities, fully integrated into the electricity system. In particular, this framework shall tackle remaining barriers, including non-financial ones such as insufficient digital and human resources of authorities to process a growing number of permitting applications.

generation. Member States should therefore ensure that the deployment of renewable electricity continues to increase at an adequate pace to meet growing demand ***including by ensuring a more robust power supply to meet the specific demands of rural areas and promoting localized solutions with emerging technologies in the renewable sector which will have the twin benefits of respecting the proximity decentralised principle and enabling more local control of supply***. For this, Member States should establish a framework that includes ***market-based as well as*** market-compatible mechanisms to tackle remaining barriers to have secure and adequate electricity systems fit for a high level of renewable energy, as well as storage facilities, fully integrated into the electricity system. In particular, this framework shall tackle remaining barriers, including non-financial ones such as insufficient digital and human resources of authorities to process a growing number of permitting applications. ***Considering the challenge presented by the 2030 target of 40% of energy from renewable sources, it should be stressed that all renewable sources and the technologies that use them to produce energy can be developed and exploited, including biomass in the heating and cooling sector and biofuels in transport, in particular advanced biofuels, provided that the limits and criteria set out in this Directive are respected as well as the cascading guidance and the waste-resource hierarchy in Directive 2008/98 of the European Parliament and of the Council^{1a}***.

^{1a} ***Directive 2008/98/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 19 November 2008 on waste and repealing certain Directives (OJ L 372, 22.11.2008, p. 3).***

Amendment 9

Proposal for a directive Recital 8 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(8a) The installation of renewable energy projects on rural land and on agricultural land in general should be governed by the principles of proportionality, complementarity and compensation. Member States should ensure the orderly deployment of renewable projects in order to avoid the loss of agricultural land, and encourage the development and use of appropriate technologies that render renewable energy production compatible with agricultural and livestock production.

Amendment 10

Proposal for a directive Recital 9

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(9) The market for renewable power purchase agreements is rapidly growing and provides a complementary route to the market of renewable power generation in addition to support schemes by Member States or to selling directly on the wholesale electricity market. At the same time, the market for renewable power purchase agreements is still limited to a small number of Member States and large companies, with significant administrative, technical and financial barriers remaining in large parts of the Union's market. The existing measures in Article 15 to encourage the uptake of renewable power purchase agreements should therefore be strengthened further, by exploring the use of credit guarantees to reduce these agreements' financial risks, taking into account that these guarantees, where

(9) The market for renewable power purchase agreements is rapidly growing and provides a complementary route to the market of renewable power generation in addition to support schemes by Member States or to selling directly on the wholesale electricity market. At the same time, the market for renewable power purchase agreements is still limited to a small number of Member States and large companies, with significant administrative, technical and financial barriers remaining in large parts of the Union's market ***and in particular for small and medium-sized enterprises operating in various sectors.*** The existing measures in Article 15 to encourage the uptake of renewable power purchase agreements should therefore be strengthened further, ***and in certain cases expedited,*** by exploring the use of credit

public, should not crowd out private financing.

guarantees to reduce these agreements' financial risks, taking into account that these guarantees, where public, should not crowd out private financing.

Amendment 11

Proposal for a directive

Recital 10

Text proposed by the Commission

(10) Overly complex and excessively long administrative procedures constitute a major barrier for the deployment of renewable energy. On the basis of the measures to improve administrative procedures for renewable energy installations that Member States are to report on by 15 March 2023 in their first integrated national energy and climate progress reports pursuant to Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council¹⁵, the Commission should assess whether the provisions included in this Directive to streamline these procedures have resulted in smooth and proportionate procedures. If that assessment reveals significant scope for improvement, the Commission should take appropriate measures to ensure Member States have streamlined and efficient administrative procedures in place.

¹⁵ Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2018 on the Governance of the Energy Union and Climate Action, amending Regulations (EC) No 663/2009 and (EC) No 715/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Directives 94/22/EC, 98/70/EC, 2009/31/EC, 2009/73/EC, 2010/31/EU, 2012/27/EU and

Amendment

(10) Overly complex and excessively long administrative procedures constitute a major barrier for the deployment of renewable energy ***and generally result in substantial costs, especially for SMEs***. On the basis of the measures to improve administrative procedures for renewable energy installations that Member States are to report on by 15 March 2023 in their first integrated national energy and climate progress reports pursuant to Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council¹⁵, the Commission should assess whether the provisions included in this Directive to streamline these procedures have resulted in smooth and proportionate procedures. If that assessment reveals significant scope for improvement, the Commission should take appropriate measures to ensure Member States have streamlined and efficient administrative procedures in place, ***identifying additional measures to provide support in key sectors such as agriculture, for example***.

¹⁵ Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2018 on the Governance of the Energy Union and Climate Action, amending Regulations (EC) No 663/2009 and (EC) No 715/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Directives 94/22/EC, 98/70/EC, 2009/31/EC, 2009/73/EC, 2010/31/EU, 2012/27/EU and

2013/30/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Directives 2009/119/EC and (EU) 2015/652 and repealing Regulation (EU) No 525/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council (OJ L 328, 21.12.2018, p. 1).

2013/30/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Directives 2009/119/EC and (EU) 2015/652 and repealing Regulation (EU) No 525/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council (OJ L 328, 21.12.2018, p. 1).

Amendment 12

Proposal for a directive

Recital 11

Text proposed by the Commission

(11) Buildings have a large untapped potential to contribute effectively to the reduction in greenhouse gas emissions in the Union. The decarbonisation of heating and cooling in this sector through an increased share in production and use of renewable energy will be needed to meet the ambition set in the Climate Target Plan to achieve the Union objective of climate neutrality. **However**, progress on the use of renewables for heating and cooling **has been stagnant in the last decade, largely relying on increased use of biomass**. Without the establishment of targets to increase the production and use of renewable energy in buildings, there will be no ability to track progress and identify bottlenecks in the uptake of renewables. Furthermore, the creation of targets will provide a long-term signal to investors, including for the period immediately after 2030. This will complement obligations related to energy efficiency and the energy performance of buildings. Therefore, indicative targets for the use of renewable energy in buildings should be set to guide and incentivise Member States' efforts to exploit the potential of using and producing renewable energy in buildings, encourage the development of and integration of technologies which produce renewable energy while providing certainty for investors and local level engagement.

Amendment

(11) Buildings, **including agricultural buildings**, have a large untapped potential to contribute effectively to the reduction in greenhouse gas emissions in the Union. The decarbonisation of heating and cooling in this sector through an increased share in production and use of renewable energy will be needed to meet the ambition set in the Climate Target Plan to achieve the Union objective of climate neutrality **and particularly to increase the rate of** progress on the use of renewables for heating and cooling. Without the establishment of targets to increase the production and use of renewable energy in buildings, there will be no ability to track progress and identify bottlenecks in the uptake of renewables. Furthermore, the creation of targets will provide a long-term signal to investors, including for the period immediately after 2030. This will complement obligations related to energy efficiency and the energy performance of buildings. Therefore, indicative targets for the use of renewable energy in buildings should be set to guide and incentivise Member States' efforts to exploit the potential of using and producing renewable energy in buildings, **including agricultural buildings**. encourage the development of and integration of technologies which produce **affordable** renewable energy **to combat energy poverty in agricultural and rural areas** while providing certainty for

investors and local level engagement.

Amendment 13

Proposal for a directive Recital 12 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(12a) Agricultural and horticultural businesses have space and roof area and they produce biomass. These are assets that allow them to play a key role in the energy transition of rural areas and within rural communities, especially given the decentralised production. The sector is a relatively small user of energy and can produce significantly more renewable energy than it needs. This is why the roll-out of energy sharing and energy communities should be further encouraged and supported.

Amendment 14

Proposal for a directive Recital 12 b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(12b) In view of the scope for capture and use of renewable energy on farms and agricultural establishments, Member States should ensure that adequate numbers of specialists are trained in the specificities of renewable heating and cooling installations for farm buildings, including those adapted for use of waste on-farm.

Justification

The full potential for use of renewables on farm should not be missed because of a lack of specialists trained in installing systems on farm buildings.

Amendment 15

Proposal for a directive Recital 14

Text proposed by the Commission

(14) Infrastructure development for district heating and cooling networks should be stepped up and steered towards harnessing a wider range of renewable heat and cold sources in an efficient and flexible way in order to increase the deployment of renewable energy and deepen energy system integration. It is therefore appropriate to update the list of renewable energy sources that district heating and cooling networks should increasingly accommodate and require the integration of thermal energy storage as a source of flexibility, greater energy efficiency and more cost-effective operation.

Amendment

(14) Infrastructure development for district heating and cooling networks should be stepped up and steered towards harnessing a wider range of renewable heat and cold sources in an efficient and flexible way in order to increase the deployment of renewable energy and deepen energy system integration. It is therefore appropriate to update the list of renewable energy sources that district heating and cooling networks should increasingly accommodate and require the integration of thermal energy storage as a source of flexibility, greater energy efficiency and more cost-effective operation. ***The development of energy initiatives in line with the ideals of the circular economy where farmers and landowners would be incentivized to create district heating schemes using farm waste and by-products should be encouraged.***

Amendment 16

Proposal for a directive Recital 15

Text proposed by the Commission

(15) With more than 30 million electric vehicles expected in the Union by 2030 it is necessary to ensure that they can fully contribute to the system integration of renewable electricity, and thus allow reaching higher shares of renewable electricity in a cost-optimal manner. The potential of electric vehicles to absorb renewable electricity at times when it is abundant and feed it back into a grid when there is scarcity has to be fully utilised. It is therefore appropriate to introduce specific

Amendment

(15) With more than 30 million electric vehicles expected in the Union by 2030 it is necessary to ensure that, ***where appropriate***, they can fully contribute to the system integration of renewable electricity, and thus allow reaching higher shares of renewable electricity in a cost-optimal manner. The potential of electric vehicles to absorb renewable electricity at times when it is abundant and feed it back into a grid when there is scarcity has to be fully utilised. ***It is important to support***

measures on electric vehicles and information about renewable energy and how and when to access it which complement those in Directive (EU) 2014/94 of the European Parliament and of the Council¹⁶ and the [proposed Regulation concerning batteries and waste batteries, repealing Directive 2006/66/EC and amending Regulation (EU) No 2019/1020].

new start-ups by introducing "smart grids" and developing special instruments, to incentivize farmers and rural Co-operatives to enter the market. It is therefore appropriate to introduce specific measures on electric vehicles ***including those used in agriculture*** and information about renewable energy and how and when to access it which complement those in Directive (EU) 2014/94 of the European Parliament and of the Council¹⁶ and the [proposed Regulation concerning batteries and waste batteries, repealing Directive 2006/66/EC and amending Regulation (EU) No 2019/1020]. ***At the same time more investment in and technological development of agricultural machinery engines used for various purposes will be needed, allowing for a combination of different energy sources, as well as measures and programmes to facilitate access to such machinery, and for renewing agricultural vehicles with regard to energy efficiency. Member States should also review their rules on the classification of agricultural machinery with a view to improved energy efficiency an adaptation to current and available technological developments.***

¹⁶ Directive 2014/94/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 October 2014 on the deployment of alternative fuels infrastructure (OJ L 307, 28.10.2014, p. 1)

¹⁶ Directive 2014/94/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 October 2014 on the deployment of alternative fuels infrastructure (OJ L 307, 28.10.2014, p. 1)

Amendment 17

Proposal for a directive Recital 20

Text proposed by the Commission

(20) Recharging points where electric vehicles typically park for extended periods of time, such as where people park for reasons of residence or employment,

Amendment

(20) Recharging points ***at strategic locations in both urban and rural areas,*** where electric vehicles typically park for extended periods of time, such as where

are highly relevant to energy system integration, therefore smart charging functionalities need to be ensured. In this regard, the operation of non-publicly accessible normal charging infrastructure is particularly important for the integration of electric vehicles in the electricity system as it is located where electric vehicles are parked repeatedly for long periods of time, such as in buildings with restricted access, employee parking *or* parking facilities rented out to natural or legal persons.

people park for reasons of residence or employment, *or access to key community, medical or commercial services* are highly relevant to energy system integration, therefore smart charging functionalities need to be ensured. *Specific initiatives should be taken to increase the number of recharging points in rural and sparsely populated areas, and to ensure adequate distribution in the most remote and mountainous ones, so that the increased use of electric vehicles in the agricultural sector is not hindered by the lack of infrastructure.* In this regard, the operation of non-publicly accessible normal charging infrastructure is particularly important for the integration of electric vehicles in the electricity system as it is located where electric vehicles are parked repeatedly for long periods of time, such as in buildings with restricted access, employee parking, parking facilities rented out to natural or legal persons, *and in rural areas at existing agricultural heritage infrastructures, or parking on-farm or electric agricultural vehicles.*

Amendment 18

Proposal for a directive Recital 21 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(21a) Member States should promote the necessary spatial planning instruments that classify agricultural soils and identify soils of high agricultural value on the basis of their edaphological characteristics. In their policies for the development and promotion of renewable energies, Member States should ensure the purpose of these soils is preserved for agricultural and livestock use.

Amendment 19

Proposal for a directive
Recital 22

Text proposed by the Commission

(22) Renewable fuels of non-biological origin can be used for energy purposes, but also for non-energy purposes as feedstock or raw material in industries such as steel or chemicals. The use of renewable fuels of non-biological origin for both purposes exploits their full potential to replace fossil fuels used as feedstock and to reduce greenhouse gas emissions in industry and should therefore be ***included in a*** target for the use of renewable ***fuels of non-biological origin***. National measures to support the uptake of renewable fuels of non-biological origin in industry should not result in net pollution increases due to an increased demand for electricity generation that is satisfied by the most polluting fossil fuels, such as coal, diesel, lignite, oil peat and oil shale.

Amendment

(22) Renewable fuels of non-biological origin can be used for energy purposes, but also for non-energy purposes as feedstock or raw material in industries such as steel or chemicals. The use of renewable fuels of non-biological origin for both purposes exploits their full potential to replace fossil fuels used as feedstock and to reduce greenhouse gas emissions in industry and should therefore be ***acknowledged as a renewable feedstock which can contribute towards the overall*** target for the use of renewable ***energy as well as sustainable raw materials for industrial production***. ***It is however important that Member State's access to renewable energy is taken into consideration and accounted for when setting up such a target. In addition, the target should be technology neutral and enable choosing the best available technological pathway depending on the context***. National measures to support the uptake of renewable fuels of non-biological origin in industry should not result in net pollution increases due to an increased demand for electricity generation that is satisfied by the most polluting fossil fuels, such as coal, diesel, lignite, oil peat and oil shale.

Amendment 20

Proposal for a directive
Recital 22 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(22a) Whereas the Renewable Fuels of Non-Biological Origins' target on industry will have a significant impact on the production of ammonia and the derived nitrogenous fertilizers, which

currently represent a third of hydrogen use in Union industry. As a consequence, Union food security must be considered. To ensure the latter, there is a need to maintain a geographically diverse fertilizer industry, which includes sites with lower access to renewable energy. Furthermore, while meeting these targets, the possible price increases of products developed with renewable this energy, such as fertilizers, must always be taken into account. Higher targets should not result in higher prices for fertilizers, and thus ultimately in higher production costs for farmers, at least not without additional support.

Amendment 21

Proposal for a directive Recital 22 b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(22b) Since the feedstocks of advanced biofuels listed in Part A of Annex IX also have a material application, special attention should be paid to cascading and waste hierarchy within this list.

Amendment 22

Proposal for a directive Recital 24 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(24a) The agricultural sector has the potential to produce additional renewable electricity. This renewable electricity is produced in a decentralised way, which is an opportunity in the energy transition. In order to put this electricity on the grid, this grid needs to have sufficient capacity. However, in rural areas the grid often ends and therefore has insufficient capacity to accommodate additional

electricity. Grid reinforcement in rural areas should be strongly encouraged so that farms can actually fulfil their potential contribution to the energy transition through decentralised electricity production;

Amendment 23

Proposal for a directive Recital 24 b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(24b) Small-scale on-farm energy production installations have an enormous potential to increase the on-farm circularity by transforming the waste and residual streams of the farm, amongst others manure, into heat and electricity. Therefore, all barriers should be removed to encourage farmers to invest in these technologies towards a circular farm, such as pocket digesters. One of these barriers is the valorisation of residues of the process, for instance RENURE, as well as ammonium sulphate, which should be able to be categorised and used as fertilizers.

Amendment 24

Proposal for a directive Recital 25 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(25a) Given that a large number of households, especially individual homes or small farms in rural areas, rely heavily on wood biomass for heating, a more holistic approach should be adopted to the modification of heating systems. The Commission should make available to Member States a set of measures, including funding, to support vulnerable households and reduce the social impact

and development gap in rural areas of the Union. In addition, such measures contribute to ensuring a level playing field for rural farmers.

Amendment 25

Proposal for a directive Recital 27

Text proposed by the Commission

(27) Waste heat and cold are underused despite their wide availability, leading to a waste of resources, lower energy efficiency in national energy systems and higher than necessary energy consumption in the Union. Requirements for closer coordination between district heating and cooling operators, industrial and tertiary sectors, and local authorities could facilitate the dialogue and cooperation necessary to harness cost-effective waste heat and cold potentials via district heating and cooling systems.

Amendment

(27) Waste heat and cold are underused despite their wide availability, leading to a waste of resources, lower energy efficiency in national energy systems and higher than necessary energy consumption in the Union. Requirements for closer coordination between district heating and cooling operators, industrial and tertiary sectors, and local authorities, ***including in rural areas***, could facilitate the dialogue and cooperation necessary to harness cost-effective waste heat and cold potentials via district heating and cooling systems.

Amendment 26

Proposal for a directive Recital 29 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(29a) Furthermore, biofuels from agricultural raw materials are a cost-effective tool for reducing emissions in existing and future light and heavy transport, given its current scope and the lifetime of vehicles, so their participation should not be limited only to transport sectors which cannot be electrified. In its Delegated Regulation (EU) 2019/807^{1a}, the Commission confirmed that European biofuels from agricultural raw materials are not drivers of deforestation. Only biofuels from feedstock with a high indirect land-use change risk need to be

phased out. The existing limit should therefore be revised in such a way as to give each Member State the necessary flexibility with regard to the increased reduction targets and the use of RES, which will allow Member States to exercise their right to use their own energy resources as laid down in the Treaty. Each Member State should be able to set its own share of biofuels from agricultural raw materials provided that at Union level the share does not exceed 7% of final energy consumption in the transport sector.

^{1a} Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2019/807 of 13 March 2019 supplementing Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the determination of high indirect land-use change-risk feedstock for which a significant expansion of the production area into land with high carbon stock is observed and the certification of low indirect land-use change-risk biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels (OJ L 133, 21.5.2019, p. 1).

Amendment 27

Proposal for a directive Recital 31

Text proposed by the Commission

(31) The Union's renewable energy policy aims to contribute to achieving the climate change mitigation objectives of the European Union in terms of the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions. In the pursuit of this goal, it is essential to also contribute to wider environmental objectives, and in particular the prevention of biodiversity loss, which is negatively impacted by the indirect land use change associated **to** the

Amendment

(31) The Union's renewable energy policy aims to contribute to achieving the climate change mitigation objectives of the European Union in terms of the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions. In the pursuit of this goal, it is essential to also contribute to wider environmental objectives, and in particular the prevention of biodiversity loss, which is negatively impacted by the indirect land use change associated **with**

production of *certain* biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels. Contributing to these climate and environmental objectives constitutes a deep and longstanding intergenerational concern for Union citizens and the Union legislator. *As a consequence, the changes in the way the transport target is calculated should not affect the limits established on how to account toward that target certain fuels produced from food and feed crops on the one hand and high indirect land-use change-risk fuels on the other hand. In addition, in order not to create an incentive to use biofuels and biogas produced from food and feed crops in transport, Member States should continue to be able to choose whether count them or not towards the transport target. If they do not count them, they may reduce the greenhouse gas intensity reduction target accordingly, assuming that food and feed crop-based biofuels save 50% greenhouse gas emissions, which corresponds to the typical values set out in an annex to this Directive for the greenhouse gas emission savings of the most relevant production pathways of food and feed crop-based biofuels as well as the minimum savings threshold applying to most installations producing such biofuels.*

the production of *high indirect land-use change risk* biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels. Contributing to these climate and environmental objectives constitutes a deep and longstanding intergenerational concern for Union citizens and the Union legislator. *Sustainable biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels that co-generate valuable protein or animal and human consumption, and are deforestation-free, should be a key element in the decarbonisation of transport, within reasonable limits and without negative impacts on the availability of food and feed resources.*

Amendment 28

Proposal for a directive Recital 31 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(31a) The Union's renewable energy policy aims to contribute to achieving the climate change mitigation objectives of the European Union in terms of the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions. In the pursuit of this goal, it is essential to also contribute to wider environmental objectives, and in particular the prevention of biodiversity loss, which is

negatively impacted by the indirect land use change associated to the production of certain biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels. At the same time, it is essential to work towards the objective of ensuring sufficient, high quality and affordable food for all European citizens in a bid to achieve the Union's goal of reducing greenhouse gas emissions. Contributing to these climate and environmental objectives constitutes a deep and longstanding intergenerational concern for Union citizens and the Union legislator. As a consequence, the changes in the way the transport target is calculated should not affect the limits established on how to account toward that target certain fuels produced from food and feed crops on the one hand and high indirect land-use change-risk fuels on the other hand. In addition, in order not to create an incentive to use biofuels and biogas produced from food and feed crops in transport, Member States should continue to be able to choose whether count them or not towards the transport target. If they do not count them, they may reduce the greenhouse gas intensity reduction target accordingly, assuming that food and feed crop-based biofuels save 50% greenhouse gas emissions, which corresponds to the typical values set out in an annex to this Directive for the greenhouse gas emission savings of the most relevant production pathways of food and feed crop-based biofuels as well as the minimum savings threshold applying to most installations producing such biofuels.

Amendment 29

Proposal for a directive Recital 32

Text proposed by the Commission

(32) Expressing the transport target as a

AD\1252506EN.docx

Amendment

(32) Expressing the transport target as a

25/64

PE700.585v02-00

greenhouse gas intensity reduction target makes it unnecessary to use multipliers to promote certain renewable energy sources. This is because different renewable energy sources save different amounts of greenhouse gas emissions and, therefore, contribute differently to a target. Renewable electricity *should be considered to have zero emissions, meaning it saves 100%* emissions compared to electricity produced from fossil fuels. This will create an incentive for the use of renewable electricity since renewable fuels and recycled carbon fuels are unlikely to achieve such a high percentage of savings. Electrification relying on renewable energy sources would therefore become the most efficient way to decarbonise road transport. In addition, in order to promote the use of advanced biofuels and biogas and renewable fuels of non-biological origin in the aviation and maritime modes, which are difficult to electrify, it is appropriate to keep the multiplier for those fuels supplied in those modes when counted towards the specific targets set for those fuels.

Amendment 30

Proposal for a directive Recital 35

Text proposed by the Commission

(35) To ensure higher environmental effectiveness of the Union sustainability and greenhouse emissions saving criteria for solid biomass fuels in installations producing heating, electricity and cooling, the minimum threshold for the applicability of such criteria should be lowered from the current 20 MW to **5** MW.

Amendment 31

greenhouse gas intensity reduction target makes it unnecessary to use multipliers to promote certain renewable energy sources. This is because different renewable energy sources save different amounts of greenhouse gas emissions and, therefore, contribute differently to a target. Renewable electricity *can have lower* emissions compared to electricity produced from fossil fuels *if the principles of the circular economy are complied with*. This will create an incentive for the use of renewable electricity since renewable fuels and recycled carbon fuels are unlikely to achieve such a high percentage of savings. Electrification relying on renewable energy sources would therefore become the most efficient way to decarbonise road transport. In addition, in order to promote the use of advanced biofuels and biogas and renewable fuels of non-biological origin in the aviation and maritime modes, which are difficult to electrify, it is appropriate to keep the multiplier for those fuels supplied in those modes when counted towards the specific targets set for those fuels.

Amendment

(35) To ensure higher environmental effectiveness of the Union sustainability and greenhouse emissions saving criteria for solid biomass fuels in installations producing heating, electricity and cooling, the minimum threshold for the applicability of such criteria should be lowered from the current 20 MW to **10** MW.

Proposal for a directive
Recital 36

Text proposed by the Commission

(36) Directive (EU) 2018/2001 strengthened the bioenergy sustainability and greenhouse gas savings framework by setting criteria for all end-use sectors. It set out specific rules for biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels produced from forest biomass, requiring the sustainability of harvesting operations and the accounting of land-use change emissions. To achieve an enhanced protection of especially biodiverse and carbon-rich habitats, such as primary forests, highly biodiverse forests, grasslands and peat lands, exclusions and limitations to source forest biomass from those areas should be introduced, in line with the approach for biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels produced from agricultural biomass. In addition, the greenhouse gas emission saving criteria should also apply to existing biomass-based installations to ensure that bioenergy production in all such installations leads to greenhouse gas emission reductions compared to energy produced from fossil fuels.

Amendment

(36) Directive (EU) 2018/2001 strengthened the bioenergy sustainability and greenhouse gas savings framework by setting criteria for all end-use sectors. It set out specific rules for biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels produced from forest biomass, requiring the sustainability of harvesting operations and the accounting of land-use change emissions. To achieve an enhanced protection of especially biodiverse and carbon-rich habitats, such as primary forests, highly biodiverse forests, grasslands and peat lands, exclusions and limitations to source forest biomass from those areas should be introduced ***in those Member States where such measure have not yet been introduced, and be implemented with specific measures in all Member States in accordance with Directive 2018/2001***, in line with the approach for biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels produced from agricultural biomass. In addition, the greenhouse gas emission saving criteria should also apply to existing biomass-based installations to ensure that bioenergy production in all such installations leads to greenhouse gas emission reductions compared to energy produced from fossil fuels. ***Policies for promoting energy from renewable sources, particularly forest and agricultural biomass, should follow circular economy principles and play a full role in building a sustainable bioeconomy, maximising resource efficiency which keeps the value of bio-based materials, products, and raw materials in the economy for as long as possible by prioritising production of long lived products and reserving use for energy purposes at the end of the lifecycle of these resources.***

Amendment 32

Proposal for a directive Recital 37

Text proposed by the Commission

(37) In order to reduce the administrative burden for producers of renewable fuels and recycled carbon fuels and for Member States, where voluntary or national schemes have been recognised by the Commission through an implementing act as giving evidence or providing accurate data regarding the compliance with sustainability and greenhouse gas emissions saving criteria as well as other requirements set in this Directive, Member States should accept the results of the certification issued by such schemes within the scope of the Commission's recognition. In order to **reduce the** burden on small installations, Member States should establish a simplified verification mechanism for installations of between **5 and 10MW**.

Amendment

(37) In order to reduce the administrative burden for producers of renewable fuels and recycled carbon fuels and for Member States, where voluntary or national schemes have been recognised by the Commission through an implementing act as giving evidence or providing accurate data regarding the compliance with sustainability and greenhouse gas emissions saving criteria as well as other requirements set in this Directive, Member States should accept the results of the certification issued by such schemes within the scope of the Commission's recognition. In order to **avoid disproportionate** burden on small **or medium** installations, **or on farmers and local businesses contributing to rural development and forestry and engaged in agricultural residue valorisation**, Member States should establish a simplified verification mechanism for installations of between **10 and 15MW**.

Amendment 33

Proposal for a directive Recital 38 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(38a) Adequate anti-fraud provisions must be laid down, in particular in relation to used cooking oil (UCO) given the widespread mixing of palm oil. As the detection and prevention of fraud is essential to prevent unfair competition and rampant deforestation in third countries, full and certified traceability of these raw materials should be

implemented.

Amendment 34

Proposal for a directive

Recital 46 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(46a) In implementing this regulation, account should be taken of Article 349 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU), which acknowledges the particular vulnerability of the outermost regions arising from their remoteness from mainland regions, insularity, small size, difficult topography and climate and economic dependence on a few products, a combination that severely restrains their development and generates substantial extra costs in many areas, particularly for transport. Efforts being made and targets set at European level for greenhouse gas reduction must be adapted to this difficult situation, balancing environmental objectives against the high social costs for these regions.

Amendment 35

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 1 – point a

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 2 – paragraph 2 – point 36

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(36) ‘renewable fuels of non-biological origin’ means liquid and gaseous fuels the energy content of which is derived from renewable sources ***other than biomass***;

(36) ‘renewable fuels of non-biological origin’ means liquid and gaseous fuels the energy content of which is derived from renewable sources;

Justification

Considering the Renewable Energy Directive does not promote a distinction between

renewable electricity sources, provided that electricity from biomass or biogas is generated respecting the sustainability requirement, its use for the production of RFNBOs should not be restricted.

Amendment 36

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 1 – point a a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 2 – paragraph 2 – point 42

Present text

(42) ‘non-food cellulosic material’ means feedstock mainly composed of cellulose and hemicellulose, and having a lower lignin content than ligno-cellulosic material, including food and feed crop residues, such as straw, stover, husks and shells; grassy energy crops with a low starch content, such as ryegrass, switchgrass, miscanthus, giant cane; cover crops before and after main crops; ley crops; industrial residues, including from food and feed crops after vegetal oils, sugars, starches and protein have been extracted; and material from biowaste, where ***ley and cover crops are understood to be temporary, short-term sown pastures comprising grass-legume mixture with a low starch content to obtain fodder for livestock and improve soil fertility for obtaining higher yields of arable main crops;***

Amendment

(aa) point (42) is replaced by the following:

(42) ‘non-food cellulosic material’ means feedstock mainly composed of cellulose and hemicellulose, and having a lower lignin content than ligno-cellulosic material, including food and feed crop residues, such as straw, stover, husks and shells; grassy energy crops with a low starch content such as ryegrass, switchgrass, miscanthus, ***silphium***, giant cane; cover crops before and after main crops, leycrops; industrial residues, including from food and feed crops after vegetal oils, sugars, starches and protein have been extracted; ***wild flowering plants*** and material from biowaste, where ***wild flowering plant are understood to be perennial polycultures, consisting of at least 15 wild flower-rich plant species of annual, biannual and perennial nature;***

Justification

The current definition of non-food cellulosic material is too narrow, as it only fits specific climatic conditions of Continental and Mediterranean Europe. The use of cover crops increases soil health, fertility and carbon sequestration. The definition should be widened to increase flexibility and incentivise the planting of cover crops, including flowering cover crops that are beneficial to pollinators.

Amendment 37

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 2 – point b

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 3 – paragraph 3 – subparagraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

Member States shall take measures to ensure that energy from biomass is produced in a way that minimises undue distortive effects on the biomass raw material market and harmful impacts on biodiversity. To that end, they shall take into account the waste hierarchy as set out in Article 4 of Directive 2008/98/EC **and the cascading principle referred to in the third subparagraph.**

Amendment

Member States shall take measures to ensure that energy from biomass is produced in a way that minimises undue distortive effects on the biomass raw material market and harmful impacts on biodiversity. To that end, they shall take into account the waste hierarchy as set out in Article 4 of Directive 2008/98/EC.

Justification

No legislation should be introduced on the cascading principle, as this could inhibit important innovations for the optimal use of wood.

Amendment 38

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 2 – point b

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 3 – paragraph 3 – subparagraph 2 – point a – point i

Text proposed by the Commission

(i) the use of saw logs, veneer logs, stumps and roots to produce energy.

Amendment

deleted

Amendment 39

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 2 – point b

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 3 – paragraph 3 – subparagraph 2 – point b

Text proposed by the Commission

(b) From 31 December 2026, and without prejudice to the obligations in the first sub-paragraph, Member States **shall** grant **no** support to the production of electricity from forest biomass **in electricity-only-installations, unless such electricity meets at least one of the following conditions:**

- (i) **it** is produced in a region identified in a territorial just transition plan approved by the European Commission, in accordance with Regulation (EU) 2021/... of the European Parliament and the Council establishing the Just Transition Fund due to its reliance on solid fossil fuels, and meets the relevant requirements set in Article 29(11);
- (ii) **it** is produced applying Biomass CO₂ Capture and Storage and meets the requirements set in Article 29(11), second subparagraph.

Amendment

(b) From 31 December 2026, and without prejudice to the obligations in the first sub-paragraph, Member States **may** grant support to the production of electricity from forest biomass, **on condition that** the following **three requirements are met:**

i) cogeneration is guaranteed and that this provides for the energy enhancement of at least 50% of the thermal energy generated by the process;

ii) the biomass used in the plants comes in order of priority from agroforestry plantations with integrated agricultural production, perennial short rotation coppice planted on previously abandoned land, or forest waste from sustainable forest management on a territorial scale;

iii) the plants have an electrical power not exceeding 10 MW and are equipped with suitable filter systems for fine dust;

(b a) the conditions referred to in point b) above may be waived if at least one of the following conditions occurs:

(i) **the electricity** is produced in a region identified in a territorial just transition plan approved by the European Commission, in accordance with Regulation (EU) 2021/... of the European Parliament and the Council establishing the Just Transition Fund due to its reliance on solid fossil fuels, and meets the relevant requirements set in Article 29(11);

(ii) **the electricity** is produced applying Biomass CO₂ Capture and Storage and meets the requirements set in Article 29(11), second subparagraph;

(ii a) the electricity is produced in an area where there is no commercial demand for heat;

(ii b) it is produced in a facility which is part of a support scheme that is designed to remove the risk of security of supply or ensure grid stability and meets the relevant requirements set in Article 29(11);

Amendment 40

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 2 – point b

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 3 – paragraph 3 – subparagraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

No later than one year after [the entry into force of this amending Directive], the Commission shall adopt a delegated act in accordance with Article 35 on how to apply the cascading principle for biomass, in particular on how to minimise the use of quality roundwood for energy production, with a focus on support schemes and with due regard to national specificities.

deleted

Justification

No legislation should be introduced on cascading use since at worst it can inhibit innovations and optimal use of wood.

Amendment 41

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 2 – point b

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 3 – paragraph 3 – subparagraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

By 2026 the Commission shall present a report on the impact of the Member States' support schemes for biomass, including on biodiversity and possible market distortions, *and will assess the possibility*

By 2026 the Commission shall present a report on the impact of the Member States' support schemes for biomass, including on biodiversity and possible market distortions.

for further limitations regarding support schemes to forest biomass.;

Justification

Re-evaluations of the regulation increase uncertainty within the energy sector and increase investment risks while slowing down the promotion of renewable energy.

Amendment 42

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 2 – point b a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 3 – paragraph 3a

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ba) Paragraph 3a is inserted:

(3a) Member States shall ensure that their national policies, including the obligations deriving from Articles 25 to 28 of this Directive, and their support schemes, are designed with due regard to the principles of the circular economy and consistent with the Circular Economy Action Plan.

Amendment 43

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 2 – point c

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 3 – paragraph 4a

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

4a. Member States shall establish a framework, which may include support schemes and facilitating the uptake of renewable power purchase agreements, enabling the deployment of renewable electricity to a level that is consistent with the Member State's national contribution referred to in paragraph 2 and at a pace that is consistent with the indicative trajectories referred to in Article 4(a)(2) of Regulation

4a. Member States shall establish a framework, which may include support schemes and facilitating the uptake of renewable power purchase agreements, enabling the deployment of renewable electricity to a level that is consistent with the Member State's national contribution referred to in paragraph 2 and at a pace that is consistent with the indicative trajectories referred to in Article 4(a)(2) of Regulation

(EU) 2018/1999. In particular, that framework shall tackle remaining barriers, including those related to permitting procedures, to a high level of renewable electricity supply. When designing that framework, Member States shall take into account the additional renewable electricity required to meet demand in the transport, industry, building and heating and cooling sectors and for the production of renewable fuels of non-biological origin.;

(EU) 2018/1999. In particular, that framework shall tackle remaining barriers, including those related to permitting procedures **for instance for on-farm medium-sized wind turbines**, to a high level of renewable electricity supply. When designing that framework, Member States shall take into account the additional renewable electricity required to meet demand in the transport, industry, building and heating and cooling sectors and for the production of renewable fuels of non-biological origin.;

Amendment 44

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 2 a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 4 – paragraph 4 – subparagraph 1

Present Text

4. Member States shall ensure that support for electricity from renewable sources is granted in an open, transparent, competitive, non-discriminatory and cost-effective manner.

Amendment

(2a) Article 4, paragraph 4 is amended as follows:

4. Member States shall ensure that support for electricity from renewable sources is granted in an open, transparent, competitive, non-discriminatory and cost-effective manner, **also ensuring adequate support for rural areas and remote regions.**

Amendment 45

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 2 b (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 4 – paragraph 4 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(2b) In Article 4, the following paragraph is inserted:

4a. Member States shall ensure that no support is granted to solar panels on

arable land currently in use for crop production, except when the agricultural production on this land can be fully maintained.

Justification

Solar panels on roofs are preferable instead of on land that is currently used as arable land.

Amendment 46

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 6

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 15 a – paragraph 2 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2a. *In new agricultural buildings or refurbishment of existing agricultural buildings, Member States shall in particular, incentivise the use of the above renewable energies and cleaner fuel options or greater energy efficiency, in order to increase the share of renewables in energy use in rural and agricultural communities, and the European Commission shall identify sources of funding to enable the Member States to do this, to support the balanced development of rural and agricultural areas.*

Amendment 47

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 6

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 15 a – paragraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

4. In order to achieve the indicative share of renewable energy set out in paragraph 1, Member States shall promote the use of renewable heating and cooling

4. In order to achieve the indicative share of renewable energy set out in paragraph 1, Member States shall promote the use of renewable heating and cooling

systems and equipment. To that end, Member States shall use all appropriate measures, tools and incentives, including, among others, energy labels developed under Regulation (EU) 2017/1369 of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁶, energy performance certificates pursuant to Directive 2010/31/EU, or other appropriate certificates or standards developed at national or Union level, and shall ensure the provision of adequate information and advice on renewable, highly energy efficient alternatives as well as on financial instruments and incentives available to promote an increased replacement rate of old heating systems and an increased switch to solutions based on renewable energy.;

²⁶ Regulation (EU) 2017/1369 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 4 July 2017 setting a framework for energy labelling and repealing Directive 2010/30/EU (OJ L 198, 28.7.2017, p. 1).

Amendment 48

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 6

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 15 a – paragraph 4 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

systems and equipment. To that end, Member States shall use all appropriate measures, tools and incentives, including, among others, energy labels developed under Regulation (EU) 2017/1369 of the European Parliament and of the Council²⁶, energy performance certificates pursuant to Directive 2010/31/EU, or other appropriate certificates or standards developed at national or Union level, and shall ensure the provision of adequate information and advice on renewable, highly energy efficient alternatives as well as on financial instruments and incentives available to promote an increased replacement rate of old heating systems and an increased switch to solutions based on renewable energy. ***Member States shall provide targeted additional support measures and information for those at risk of energy poverty, particularly in rural communities to enable their participation in the energy transition;***

²⁶ Regulation (EU) 2017/1369 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 4 July 2017 setting a framework for energy labelling and repealing Directive 2010/30/EU (OJ L 198, 28.7.2017, p. 1).

Amendment

4a. In order to increase the use of renewable energy in the agricultural sector, the support for small-scale on-farm energy production should be increased; investments in installations that can produce renewable heat and electricity from residual streams and animal waste should be encouraged while

respecting the cascading guidance and the waste-resource hierarchy in Dir.2008/98, thereby enabling more farms to be practically engaged in the the circular economy.

Amendment 49

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 6 a – (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 18 – paragraph 1

Present text

1. Member States shall ensure that information on support measures is made available to all relevant actors, such as consumers including low-income, vulnerable consumers, renewables self-consumers, renewable energy communities, builders, installers, architects, suppliers of heating, cooling and electricity equipment and systems, and suppliers of vehicles compatible with the use of renewable energy and of intelligent transport systems.

Amendment

(6a) In Article 18, paragraph 1 is replaced by the following:

1. Member States shall ensure that information on support measures is made available to all relevant actors, such as consumers, including low-income, vulnerable consumers ***including from rural, remote areas***, renewables self-consumers and renewable energy communities, builders, installers, architects, and suppliers of heating, cooling and electricity equipment and systems and suppliers of vehicles compatible with the use of renewable energy and of intelligent transport systems.

Amendment 50

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 7 – point a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 18 – paragraph 4 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(a) In Article 18, the following paragraph is inserted:

4a. Member States shall, in particular, ensure that rural and remote areas have access to sufficient numbers of installers trained in the specificities of renewable

energy and heating and cooling technologies which can be placed in or on agricultural buildings, thereby offering the potential to make an important contribution to shifting the energy mix in remote and rural areas towards use of renewables

Justification

Agricultural buildings vary in scale and many have a significant roof area suitable for photovoltaic panels. On-farm processes may produce heat or cold which, with appropriate technology, can be used to reduce use of energy from the grid. Sufficient trained specialist are needed to ensure this potential can be realised.

Amendment 51

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 9 a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 20 – paragraph 3 a and 3 b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(9a) In Article 20, the following paragraphs are inserted:

3a. Member States shall strengthen the electricity grid in rural areas so that the capacity will allow for delivering energy generated by agricultural operators to the grid at all times and encourage farms to fulfil their potential contribution to the energy transition through decentralised electricity production;

3b. 'Member States shall ensure that the national regulatory framework allows for direct energy deliveries between agricultural suppliers and final users in a region.'

Amendment 52

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 10 a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001
Article 21 – paragraph 2 – point a – introductory part

Present text

Amendment

(a) to generate renewable energy, including for their own consumption, store and sell their excess production of renewable electricity, including through renewables power purchase agreements, electricity suppliers and peer-to-peer trading arrangements, without being subject:

(10a) In Article 21, paragraph 2, point (a), introductory part is replaced by the following:

(a) to generate renewable energy, including for their own consumption, store and sell all their excess production of renewable electricity ***at market price***, including through renewables power purchase agreements, electricity suppliers and peer-to-peer trading arrangements, without being subject:

Justification

Fair pricing and the possibility of selling all excess energy is particularly important for people living in remote regions and rural areas.

Amendment 53

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 11

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 22 a – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Member States shall ensure that the contribution of renewable fuels of non-biological origin used for final energy and non-energy purposes shall be **50** % of the hydrogen used for final energy and non-energy purposes in industry by 2030. For the calculation of that percentage, the following rules shall apply:

Member States shall ensure that the contribution of renewable fuels of non-biological origin used for final energy and non-energy purposes shall be **20** % of the hydrogen used for final energy and non-energy purposes in industry by 2030.

Such target shall be set at the Union level. When setting Member State's level of contribution to the target, the access to renewable in said Member States should be taken into consideration and accounted for.

Supporting measures should be put in place to ensure that industry in Member States with lower access to renewable energy are not put at a competitive disadvantage via this target. Measures should also be taken to ensure food security and a geographically diverse industry.

This would include ensuring that downstream products, linked to this target remain affordable for downstream users, such as farmers. This shall include aid, including operating aid, to farmers as well as aid to energy-intensive undertakings.

For the calculation of that percentage, the following rules shall apply:

Amendment 54

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 12 – point b

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 23 – paragraph 1 a

Text proposed by the Commission

1a. Member States shall carry out an assessment of their potential of energy from renewable sources and of the use of waste heat and cold in the heating and cooling sector including, where appropriate, an analysis of areas suitable for their deployment at low ecological risk **and** of the potential for small-scale household projects. The assessment shall set out milestones and measures to increase renewables in heating and cooling and, where appropriate, the use of waste heat and cold through district heating and cooling with a view of establishing a long-term national strategy to decarbonise heating and cooling. The assessment shall be part of the integrated national energy and climate plans referred to in Articles 3 and 14 of Regulation (EU) 2018/1999, and shall accompany the comprehensive heating and cooling assessment required by

Amendment

1a. Member States shall carry out an assessment of their potential of energy from renewable sources and of the use of waste heat and cold in the heating and cooling sector including, where appropriate, an analysis of areas suitable for their deployment at low ecological risk, of the potential for small-scale household projects **and of the potential for projects directed at low-income households and persons at risk of energy poverty**. The assessment shall set out milestones and measures to increase renewables in heating and cooling and, where appropriate, the use of waste heat and cold through district heating and cooling with a view of establishing a long-term national strategy to decarbonise heating and cooling. The assessment shall be part of the integrated national energy and climate plans referred to in Articles 3 and 14 of

Article 14(1) of Directive 2012/27/EU.;

Regulation (EU) 2018/1999, and shall accompany the comprehensive heating and cooling assessment required by Article 14(1) of Directive 2012/27/EU.;

Amendment 55

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 12 – point d

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 23 – paragraph 4 – subparagraph 1 – point d

Text proposed by the Commission

(d) capacity building for national and local authorities to plan and implement renewable projects and infrastructures;

Amendment

(d) capacity building for national and local authorities to plan and implement renewable projects and infrastructures, ***particularly projects that have the potential to tackle energy poverty and increase the participation of low-income households in the energy transition;***

Amendment 56

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 12 – point d

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 23 – paragraph 4 – subparagraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

When adopting and implementing those measures, Member States shall ensure their accessibility to all consumers, ***in particular*** those in low-income or vulnerable households, who would not otherwise ***possess*** sufficient up-front capital ***to benefit;***

Amendment

When adopting and implementing those measures, Member States shall ensure their accessibility to all consumers, ***with specific, targeted provisions, supports and programmes to make these measures accessible to*** those in low-income or vulnerable households, ***especially in rural areas,*** who would not otherwise ***benefit from such measures, due to a lack of sufficient up-front capital and to non-financial barriers;***

Amendment 57

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 14

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 25 – paragraph 1 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

(a) the amount of renewable fuels and renewable electricity supplied to the transport sector leads to a greenhouse gas intensity reduction of at least **13** % by 2030, compared to the baseline set out in Article 27(1), point (b), in accordance with an indicative trajectory set by the Member State;

Amendment

(a) the amount of renewable fuels and renewable electricity supplied to the transport sector leads to a greenhouse gas intensity reduction of at least **16** % by 2030, compared to the baseline set out in Article 27(1), point (b), in accordance with an indicative trajectory set by the Member State;

Member States shall require suppliers, for this reduction, to comply with the following intermediate targets:

- 6 % by 31 December 2021,***
- 9% by 31 December 2024,***
- 10 % by 31 December 2025,***
- 11 % by December 2026***
- 12 % by December 2027,***
- 13,5 % by December 2028,***
- 15 % by December 2029,***
- 16 % by December 2030.***

Justification

The current RED II target for renewable energy in transport was insufficient to achieve the decarbonisation objectives set out in the European Green Deal and the 2030 Climate Law. Including in the RED an obligation to decrease the carbon intensity of transport fuels is a sensible move forward. However, the suggested obligation on suppliers to decrease the GHG intensity of fuels at least 13% by 2030 is still low and should be raised to 16%. To ensure Member States' continuous decarbonisation efforts, such obligation should be gradually increased, starting from 6% in 2021 and 16% by 2030.

Amendment 58

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 14

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 25 – paragraph 1 – point b – subparagraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

(b) the share of advanced biofuels and biogas produced from the feedstock listed in Part A of Annex IX in the energy supplied to the transport sector is at least 0,2 % in 2022, **0,5 %** in 2025 and **2,2 %** in 2030, and the share of renewable fuels of non-biological origin is at least 2,6 % in 2030.

Amendment

(b) the share of advanced biofuels and biogas produced from the feedstock listed in Part A of Annex IX in the energy supplied to the transport sector is at least 0,2 % in 2022, **1 %** in 2025 and **2,6 %** in 2030, and the share of renewable fuels of non-biological origin is at least 2,6 % in 2030. ***Member States may exempt, or distinguish between, different fuel suppliers and different energy carriers when setting the obligation on the fuel suppliers, ensuring that the varying degrees of maturity and the cost of different technologies are taken into account.***

Amendment 59

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 14

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 25 – paragraph 1 – point b – subparagraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

When setting the obligation on fuel suppliers, Member States may exempt fuel suppliers supplying electricity or renewable liquid and gaseous transport fuels of non-biological origin from the requirement to comply with the minimum share of advanced biofuels and biogas produced from the feedstock listed in Part A of Annex IX with respect to those fuels.

Amendment

When setting the obligation on fuel suppliers, Member States may exempt fuel suppliers supplying electricity or renewable liquid and gaseous transport fuels of non-biological origin from the requirement to comply with the minimum share of advanced biofuels and biogas produced from the feedstock listed in Part A of Annex IX with respect to those fuels. ***When setting the obligation referred to in points (a) and (b) of the first subparagraph to ensure the achievement of the targets set out therein, Member States may do so, inter alia, by means of measures targeting volumes, energy content or greenhouse gas emissions, provided that it is demonstrated that the greenhouse gas intensity reduction and minimum shares referred to in points (a) and (b) of the first subparagraph are***

achieved.

Amendment 60

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 15 – point a – point i

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 26 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

For the calculation of a Member State's gross final consumption of energy from renewable sources referred to in Article 7 and of the greenhouse gas intensity reduction target referred to in Article 25(1), first subparagraph, point (a), the share of biofuels and bioliquids, as well as of biomass fuels consumed in transport, where produced from food and feed crops, shall be no more than one percentage point higher than the share of such fuels in the final consumption of energy in the transport sector in **2020** in that Member State, with a maximum of 7 % of final consumption of energy in the transport sector in that Member State.;

Amendment

For the calculation of a Member State's gross final consumption of energy from renewable sources referred to in Article 7 and of the greenhouse gas intensity reduction target referred to in Article 25(1), first subparagraph, point (a), the share of biofuels and bioliquids, as well as of biomass fuels consumed in transport, where produced from food and feed crops, shall be no more than one percentage point higher than the share of such fuels in the final consumption of energy in the transport sector in **2019** in that Member State, with a maximum of 7 % of final consumption of energy in the transport sector in that Member State.

Justification

Justification for the above change is that 2020 was an atypical year due to the COVID-19 pandemic, so the reference year should be 2019, in order to allow the biofuels and bioliquids that were produced from food and feed crops to make their contribution to the overall target of renewable energy. Note - this makes one change to the text of sub-para 1, making the reference year 2019 (higher consumption than 2020 in COM text) but other parts are unchanged

Amendment 61

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 15 – point a – point ii

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 26 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ii) the fourth subparagraph is replaced by the following: **deleted**

Where the share of biofuels and bioliquids, as well as of biomass fuels consumed in transport, produced from food and feed crops in a Member State is limited to a share lower than 7 % or a Member State decides to limit the share further, that Member State may reduce the greenhouse gas intensity reduction target referred to in Article 25(1), first subparagraph, point (a), accordingly, in view of the contribution these fuels would have made in terms of greenhouse gas emissions saving. For that purpose, Member States shall consider those fuels save 50 % greenhouse gas emissions.;

Amendment 62

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 16 – point b

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 27 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 1 – point a – point iii

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(iii) for renewable electricity, by multiplying the amount of renewable electricity that is supplied to all transport modes by the fossil fuel comparator $EC_{F(e)}$ set out in in Annex V;

(iii) for renewable electricity, by multiplying the amount of renewable electricity that is supplied to all transport modes by the fossil fuel comparator $EF(t)$ set out in in Annex V;

Justification

The GHG intensity reduction equation in the Commission proposal grants a disproportionately high GHG saving for renewable electricity in transport: $EC_{F(e)}$ refers to 183 gCO₂/MJ which leads to a -195% GHG saving for renewable electricity, and which compares renewable electricity in transport to power generation by fossil fuels, not to use of gasoline or diesel in transport. Renewable electricity should be subject to a GHG saving referring to the same fossil fuel comparator as other renewable energies, i.e. $EF(t)$ which is 94 gCO₂/MJ, noting that this also leads to a very high GHG saving value for renewable electricity.

Amendment 63

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 16 – point c

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 27 – paragraph 1a – point c a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ca) the shares of biofuels and biogas for transport produced from grape marcs and wine lees may be considered to be twice its energy content during a 6-years transitional period starting from the entry into force of this Directive.

Amendment 64

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 17 – point b a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 28 – paragraph 6 – subparagraph 4 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ba) The following subparagraph is added:

Any addition to the list of feedstocks set out in Part A of Annex IX shall be accompanied by an increase of the targets set out in point b) of Article 25 (1), corresponding to the sustainable potential of these feedstock.

Justification

The inclusion of additional feedstocks on the Annex IX a list requires a corresponding increase in the targets for advanced biofuels. Additional feedstocks may jeopardize existing investments, as they increase the supply side and thus massively influence pricing. It is therefore necessary to adjust the demand side as well by increasing the sub-quota for advanced biofuels by the share corresponding to the sustainable potential of the newly included feedstocks.

Amendment 65

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point a – point i a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 1 – point c

Present text

(c) eligibility for financial support for the consumption of biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels.

Amendment

(ia) in the first subparagraph of paragraph (1), point (c) is replaced by the following :

(c) eligibility for financial support, **including fiscal incentives**, for the consumption of biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels.

Justification

Adds precision by specifying that financial support includes fiscal incentives

Amendment 66

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point a – point ii

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 4 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

— (a) in the case of solid biomass fuels, in installations producing electricity, heating and cooling with a total rated thermal input equal to or exceeding **5 MW**,

Amendment

— (a) in the case of solid biomass fuels, in installations producing electricity, heating and cooling with a total rated thermal input equal to or exceeding **10MW**,

Amendment 67

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point a – point iii a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 2

Present text

However, biofuels, bioliquids and biomass

Amendment

(iii a) (i b) the second subparagraph of paragraph (1), is amended as follows:

However, biofuels, bioliquids and biomass

fuels produced from waste and residues, other than agricultural, aquaculture, fisheries and forestry residues, are required to fulfil only the greenhouse gas emissions saving criteria laid down in paragraph 10 in order to be taken into account for the purposes referred to in points (a), (b) and (c) of the first subparagraph. This subparagraph shall also apply to waste and residues that are first processed into a product before being further processed into biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels.

fuels produced from waste and residues, other than agricultural, aquaculture, fisheries and forestry residues, are required to fulfil only the greenhouse gas emissions saving criteria laid down in paragraph 10 in order to be taken into account for the purposes referred to in points (a), (b) and (c) of the first subparagraph. ***However, their production shall be in line with the resource/waste hierarchy as laid down in Directive 2008/98/EC and shall avoid significant distortive effects on markets for by-products, wastes or residues. In the case of the use of mixed wastes, however, the operators are required to apply mixed waste sorting systems of defined quality aimed at removing fossil materials such as plastics and synthetic textiles to ensure only non-recyclable biogenic waste is used as feedstock.*** This subparagraph shall also apply to waste and residues that are first processed into a product before being further processed into biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels.

Justification

Add specifications for optimal resource use referencing the resource-waste hierarchy in Dir. 2008/98 EC

Amendment 68

Proposal for a directive
Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point b
Directive (EU) 2018/2001
Article 29 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(b) in paragraph 3, the following subparagraph is inserted after the first subparagraph:

deleted

This paragraph, with the exception of the first subparagraph, point (c), also applies to biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels produced from forest biomass.;

Justification

It is premature to revise the existing sustainability criteria for forest biomass in the Renewable Energy Directive as the implementation of the current criteria, adopted in 2018, has started recently and only in some countries. It is crucial to maintain a stable approach to bioenergy. Moreover, local conditions for biodiversity vary across the EU and cannot be effectively addressed by generalized rules in EU energy legislation. Possible concerns on health and biodiversity in EU forests are already addressed by the forest harvesting criteria in Article 29 (6).

Amendment 69

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point c

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 4 – subparagraph 2a

Text proposed by the Commission

The first subparagraph, with the exception of points (b) and (c), and the second subparagraph also apply to biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels produced from forest biomass.;

Amendment

The first subparagraph, with the exception of points (b) and (c), and the second subparagraph also apply to biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels produced from forest biomass ***from a country which does not meet the criteria set out in paragraph 6 and that was grown or harvested specifically for energy purposes***;

Amendment 70

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point d

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 5 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

5a. Biofuels, bioliquids and biomass fuels produced from agricultural biomass taken into account for the purposes referred to in points (a), (b) and (c) of the first subparagraph of paragraph 1 shall not be made from raw material obtained in a country that is not Party to the Paris Agreement.

Justification

Mirroring the provision for forest biomass, feedstock for biofuels should not be made from countries that are not Party to the Paris Agreement.

Amendment 71

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point e – introductory part

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 6 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

(e) in paragraph 6, first subparagraph, point (a), point **(iv) is** replaced by the following:

Amendment

(e) in paragraph 6, first subparagraph, point (a), point **(iii) and point (iv) are** replaced by the following:

Amendment 72

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point e

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 6 – point a – point iii

Present text

(iii) that areas designated by international or national law or by the relevant competent authority for nature protection purposes, including ***in wetlands and peatlands, are protected;***

Amendment

(iii) that areas designated by international or national law or by the relevant competent authority for nature protection purposes, including ***land that had one of the following statuses in or after January 2008 whether or not the land continues to have that status:***

- primary forest and other wooded land, namely forest and other wooded land of native species, where there is no clearly visible indication of human activity and the ecological processes are not significantly disturbed;

- wetlands, namely land that is covered with or saturated by water permanently or for a significant part of the year;

- peatland;

unless evidence is provided that the production of that raw material did not interfere with those nature protection purposes, does not involve drainage of previously undrained soil, or that evidence is provided that the harvesting of raw material is necessary to preserve its status as high-biodiversity value;

Justification

Too detailed legislation increases the risk to be quickly outdated and does not sufficiently take into account the national specific circumstances and legislative frameworks/structures. An exemplary list is more suitable to take into account national conditions and specific characteristics related to forest management and does not unnecessarily limit options that achieve the same result.

Amendment 73

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point e

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 6 – point a – point iv

Text proposed by the Commission

(iv) that harvesting is carried out considering maintenance of soil quality and biodiversity with the aim of minimising negative impacts, ***in a way that avoids harvesting of stumps and roots, degradation of primary forests or their conversion into plantation forests, and harvesting on vulnerable soils; minimises large clear-cuts and ensures*** locally appropriate ***thresholds for deadwood extraction and requirements to use logging systems that minimise impacts on soil quality, including soil compaction, and on biodiversity features and habitats;***

Amendment

(iv) that harvesting is carried out considering maintenance of soil quality and biodiversity with the aim of minimising negative impacts ***and uses*** locally appropriate ***sustainable forestry management practices;***

Justification

Too detailed legislation increases the risk to be quickly outdated and does not sufficiently take into account the national specific circumstances and legislative frameworks/structures. An exemplary list is more suitable to take into account national conditions and specific characteristics related to forest management and does not unnecessarily limit options that

achieve the same result.

Amendment 74

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point f – introductory part

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 6 – point b

Text proposed by the Commission

(f) in paragraph 6, first subparagraph, point (b), point (iv) *is* replaced by the following:

Amendment

(f) in paragraph 6, first subparagraph, point (a), ***point (iii) and*** point (iv) ***are*** replaced by the following:

Amendment 75

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point f

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 6 – point b – point iii (new)

Present Text

(iii) that areas designated by international or national law or by the relevant competent authority for nature protection purposes, including in wetlands and peatlands, are protected;

Amendment

(iii) that areas designated by international or national law or by the relevant competent authority for nature protection purposes, including ***land that had one of the following statuses in or after January 2008 whether or not the land continues to have that status:-***
primary forest and other wooded land, namely forest and other wooded land of native species, where there is no clearly visible indication of human activity and the ecological processes are not significantly disturbed;
- wetlands, namely land that is covered with or saturated by water permanently or for a significant part of the year;
- peatland;
unless evidence is provided that the production of that raw material did not interfere with those nature protection purposes, does not involve drainage of

previously undrained soil, or that evidence is provided that the harvesting of raw material is necessary to preserve its status as high-biodiversity value;

Amendment 76

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point f

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 6 – point b – point iv

Text proposed by the Commission

(iv) that harvesting is carried out considering maintenance of soil quality and biodiversity with the aim of minimising negative impacts, ***in a way that avoids harvesting of stumps and roots, degradation of primary forests or their conversion into plantation forests, and harvesting on vulnerable soils; minimises large clear-cuts and ensures locally appropriate thresholds for deadwood extraction and requirements to use logging systems that minimise impacts on soil quality, including soil compaction, and on biodiversity features and habitats;***

Amendment

(iv) that harvesting is carried out considering maintenance of soil quality and biodiversity with the aim of minimising negative impacts, ***using of*** locally appropriate ***sustainable forest management practices based on principles agreed in Forest Europe and FAO,***

Justification

The exemplary listing of this criteria is not necessary, as sustainably practises are set in national forestry legislations. Too detailed legislation increases the risk for quickly outdated legislation and takes very little into account the national specific circumstances and legislative frameworks/structures. Energy legislation is not the right place to create specific requirements relating to the content of forest legislation in Member States or third countries.

Amendment 77

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point f a (new)

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 6 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(fa) The following paragraph 6a is inserted:

6a. The Commission shall implement, at the latest by 2025, the legal framework for applying Union health, environmental and waste standards, including processes and production methods, to imported renewable fuels, and identify concrete initiatives to ensure better consistency in their application, in conformity with WTO rules.

Justification

All sustainable renewable low carbon fuels should be able to contribute towards EU's climate and renewable objectives under stricter sustainability criteria, including European standards for agricultural production, GMO policy, waste prevention and management standards, and strict traceability requirements.

Amendment 78

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 18 – point g

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 29 – paragraph 10 – point d

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(d) at least 70 % for electricity, heating and cooling production from biomass fuels used in installations until 31 December 2025, and at least 80 % from 1 January 2026.;

(d) at least 70 % for electricity, heating and cooling production from biomass fuels used in installations **starting operation from 1 January 2021** until 31 December 2025, and at least 80 % **for installations starting operation** from 1 January 2026. **;** **This would be particularly relevant to promote the ensure a smooth promotion of renewable energy in remote and rural areas as it will leave farmers and local actors the time to modernise their on-site and nearby energy production.**

Amendment 79

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 20 – point b

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 30 – paragraph 3 – subparagraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

Member States shall take measures to ensure that economic operators submit reliable information regarding the compliance with the sustainability and greenhouse gas emissions saving criteria laid down in Articles 29(2) to (7) and (10) and 29a(1) and (2), and that economic operators make available to the relevant Member State, upon request, the data used to develop that information.

Amendment

Member States shall take measures to ensure that economic operators submit reliable information regarding the compliance with the sustainability and greenhouse gas emissions saving criteria laid down in Articles 29(2) to (7) and (10) and 29a(1) and (2), and that economic operators make available to the relevant Member State, upon request, the data used to develop that information. ***Member States shall require economic operators to arrange for an adequate standard of independent auditing of the information submitted, and to provide evidence that this has been done. In order to comply with point (a), (b) and (d) of Article 29(3), point (a) of Article 29(4), Article 29(5), point (a) of Article 29(6) and point (a) of Article 29(7), the first or second party auditing may be used up to the first gathering point of the forest biomass. The auditing shall verify that the systems used by economic operators are accurate, reliable and protected against fraud, including verification ensuring that materials are not intentionally modified or discarded so that the consignment or part thereof could become a waste or residue. It shall evaluate the frequency and methodology of sampling and the robustness of the data.***

Justification

The missing part of this paragraph should be reintroduced (see. RED II Article 30(3)(1)). The exemption rule on the first/second party auditing of forest biomass should be extended to the auditing of the new criteria (“the no-go areas”).

Amendment 80

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 20 – point d

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 30 – paragraph 6 – subparagraph 3 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

For installations producing electricity heating and cooling with a total rated thermal input between **5 and 10 MW**, Member States shall establish simplified national verification schemes to ensure the fulfillment of the sustainability and greenhouse gas emissions criteria set out in paragraphs (2) to (7) and (10) of Article 29.;

For installations producing electricity heating and cooling with a total rated thermal input between **10 and 15 MW**, **in** Member States shall establish simplified national verification schemes to ensure the fulfillment of the sustainability and greenhouse gas emissions criteria set out in paragraphs (2) to (7) and (10) of Article 29. ';

Amendment 81

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 21

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 31 – paragraphs 2, 3 and 4

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(21) in Article 31, paragraphs 2, 3 and 4 are deleted:

deleted

Justification

The elimination of the possibility to calculate GHG reductions on a NUTS II level, leaving as the sole option actual calculations on a farm basis, unduly privileges big farm structures over the overwhelming European pattern of small and medium-size farms, placing an additional and disproportionate administrative burden on farmers.

Amendment 82

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 22

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 31a – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1. The Commission shall ensure that a

1. The Commission shall ensure that a

Union database is set up to enable the tracing of liquid and gaseous renewable fuels and recycled carbon fuels.

Union database is set up to enable the tracing of liquid and gaseous renewable fuels, ***including the tracing of the feedstocks listed in Annex IX used in their production***, and recycled carbon fuels.

Justification

Adequate anti-fraud provisions must be foreseen, in particular on the UCO category with the widespread mixing of palm oil. Detection and deterrence of fraud is essential to prevent unfair competition and rampant deforestation in third countries, therefore a full and certified traceability should be enforced.

Amendment 83

Proposal for a directive

Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point 22

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Article 31a – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. Member States shall require the relevant economic operators to enter in a timely manner accurate information into that database on the transactions made and the sustainability characteristics of the fuels subject to those transactions, including their life-cycle greenhouse gas emissions, starting from their point of production to the moment it is consumed in the Union. ***Information on whether support has been provided for the production of a specific consignment of fuel, and if so, on the type of support scheme, shall also be included in the database.***

Amendment

2. Member States shall require the relevant economic operators to enter in a timely manner accurate information into that database on the transactions made and the sustainability characteristics of the fuels subject to those transactions, including their life-cycle greenhouse gas emissions, starting from their point of production to the moment it is consumed in the Union.

Justification

It is essential to keep the administrative burden proportional to the benefits of the database. The current proposal is not in line with the proportionality principle to require constant updates along every part of the supply chain as soon as there is a change.

Amendment 84

Proposal for a directive
Annex I – paragraph 1 – point 5 – point a
Directive (EU) 2018/2001
Annex V – part C – point 6

Text proposed by the Commission

6. For the purposes of the calculation referred to in point 1(a), greenhouse gas emissions savings from improved agriculture management, esca, such as shifting to reduced or zero-tillage, improved crop/rotation, the use of cover crops, including crop residue management, and the use of organic soil improver (e.g. compost, manure fermentation digestate), shall be taken into account only if they do not risk to negatively affect biodiversity. Further, solid and verifiable evidence shall be provided that the soil carbon has increased or that it is reasonable to expect to have increased over the period in which the raw materials concerned were cultivated while taking into account the emissions where such practices lead to increased fertiliser and herbicide use³⁷ .;

³⁷ Measurements of soil carbon can constitute such evidence, e.g. by a first measurement in advance of the cultivation and subsequent ones at regular intervals several years apart. In such a case, before the second measurement is available, increase in soil carbon would be estimated on the basis of representative experiments or soil models. From the second measurement onwards, the measurements

Amendment

6. For the purposes of the calculation referred to in point 1(a), greenhouse gas emissions savings from improved agriculture management, esca, such as shifting to reduced or zero-tillage, **storing carbon in soil with biochar**, improved crop/rotation, the use of cover crops, including crop residue management, and the use of organic soil improver (e.g. compost, manure fermentation digestate), shall be taken into account only if they do not risk to negatively affect biodiversity. ***Carbon in biomasses can be converted into biochar through pyrolysis, which can be stored by land application, thereby making it a negative emissions technology. Here, the bonus for the improved agricultural and manure management is returned to the farmer responsible for the negative emissions when sustainability/environmental certificates are issued.***

Further, solid and verifiable evidence shall be provided that the soil carbon has increased or that it is reasonable to expect to have increased over the period in which the raw materials concerned were cultivated while taking into account the emissions where such practices lead to increased fertiliser and herbicide use³⁷ .;

³⁷ Measurements of soil carbon can constitute such evidence, e.g. by a first measurement in advance of the cultivation and subsequent ones at regular intervals several years apart. In such a case, before the second measurement is available, increase in soil carbon would be estimated on the basis of representative experiments or soil models. From the second measurement onwards, the measurements

would constitute the basis for determining the existence of an increase in soil carbon and its magnitude.

would constitute the basis for determining the existence of an increase in soil carbon and its magnitude.

Justification

It is important to look at and acknowledge valuable side streams and by-products from bioenergy production. The bonus for the negative emissions should go the stakeholder responsible for the improved management. It seems only fair that reductions from agricultural actions are also awarded in the agricultural sector.

Amendment 85

Proposal for a directive

Annex I – paragraph 1 – point 5 – point c

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Annex V – part C – point 18

Text proposed by the Commission

18. For the purposes of the calculations referred to in point 17, the emissions to be divided shall be $e_{ec} + e_l + e_{sca}$ + those fractions of e_p , e_{td} , e_{ccs} and e_{ccr} that take place up to and including the process step at which a co-product is produced. If any allocation to co-products has taken place at an earlier process step in the life-cycle, the fraction of those emissions assigned in the last such process step to the intermediate fuel product shall be used for those purposes instead of the total of those emissions. In the case of biogas and biomethane, all co-products that do not fall under the scope of point 7 shall be taken into account for the purposes of that calculation. No emissions shall be allocated to wastes and residues. Co-products that have a negative energy content shall be considered to have an energy content of zero for the purposes of the calculation. Wastes and residues including all wastes and residues included in Annex IX shall be considered to have zero life-cycle greenhouse gas emissions up to the process of collection of those materials irrespectively of whether they are

Amendment

18. For the purposes of the calculations referred to in point 17, the emissions to be divided shall be $e_{ec} + e_l + e_{sca}$ + those fractions of e_p , e_{td} , e_{ccs} and e_{ccr} that take place up to and including the process step at which a co-product is produced. ***In the case of e_{ccr} CO₂ from fermentation that is captured and re-used for replacing fossil-based CO₂ shall be considered an emission saving that is entirely allocated to the biofuel or bioliquid resulting from fermentation.*** If any allocation to co-products has taken place at an earlier process step in the life-cycle, the fraction of those emissions assigned in the last such process step to the intermediate fuel product shall be used for those purposes instead of the total of those emissions. In the case of biogas and biomethane, all co-products that do not fall under the scope of point 7 shall be taken into account for the purposes of that calculation. No emissions shall be allocated to wastes and residues. Co-products that have a negative energy content shall be considered to have an energy content of zero for the purposes of the calculation. Wastes and residues

processed to interim products before being transformed into the final product.

Residues that are not included in Annex IX and fit for use in the food or feed market shall be considered to have the same amount of emissions from the extraction, harvesting or cultivation of raw materials, eec as their closest substitute in the food and feed market that is included in the table in part D.

In the case of biomass fuels produced in refineries, other than the combination of processing plants with boilers or cogeneration units providing heat and/or electricity to the processing plant, the unit of analysis for the purposes of the calculation referred to in point 17 shall be the refinery;

including all wastes and residues included in Annex IX shall be considered to have zero life-cycle greenhouse gas emissions up to the process of collection of those materials irrespectively of whether they are processed to interim products before being transformed into the final product. In the case of biomass fuels produced in refineries, other than the combination of processing plants with boilers or cogeneration units providing heat and/or electricity to the processing plant, the unit of analysis for the purposes of the calculation referred to in point 17 shall be the refinery;

Amendment 86

Proposal for a directive

Annex I – paragraph 1 – point 6 – point c

Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Annex VI – part B – point 18 – subparagraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

Wastes and residues including all wastes and residues included in Annex IX shall be considered to have zero life-cycle greenhouse gas emissions up to the process of collection of those materials irrespectively of whether they are processed to interim products before being transformed into the final product.

Residues that are not included in Annex IX and fit for use in the food or feed market shall be considered to have the same amount of emissions from the extraction, harvesting or cultivation of raw materials, eec as their closest substitute in the food and feed market that is included in the table in part D of Annex V.

Amendment

Wastes and residues including all wastes and residues included in Annex IX shall be considered to have zero life-cycle greenhouse gas emissions up to the process of collection of those materials irrespectively of whether they are processed to interim products before being transformed into the final product.

Amendment 87

Proposal for a directive

Annex I – paragraph 1 – point 8 – point a a (new) Directive (EU) 2018/2001

Annex IX – part A

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(a a) In part A, the following point (r) is inserted:

(r) Intermediate and cover crops.

Justification

Annex IX should be reviewed to integrate cover and intermediate crops that demonstrably provide additional resources to the production of biofuels, amongst other environmental benefits.

PROCEDURE – COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

Title	Amending Directive (EU) 2018/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Regulation (EU) 2018/1999 of the European Parliament and of the Council and Directive 98/70/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards the promotion of energy from renewable sources, and repealing Council Directive (EU) 2015/652
References	COM(2021)0557 – C9-0329/2021 – 2021/0218(COD)
Committee responsible Date announced in plenary	ITRE 13.9.2021
Opinion by Date announced in plenary	AGRI 11.11.2021
Rapporteur for the opinion Date appointed	Pina Picierno 9.9.2021
Discussed in committee	9.11.2021 25.1.2022
Date adopted	20.4.2022
Result of final vote	+: 35 –: 9 0: 4
Members present for the final vote	Mazaly Aguilar, Clara Aguilera, Atidzhe Alieva-Veli, Álvaro Amaro, Carmen Avram, Adrian-Dragoş Benea, Benoît Biteau, Mara Bizzotto, Daniel Buda, Isabel Carvalhais, Asger Christensen, Angelo Ciocca, Ivan David, Paolo De Castro, Jérémy Decerle, Salvatore De Meo, Herbert Dorfmann, Luke Ming Flanagan, Dino Giarrusso, Francisco Guerreiro, Martin Häusling, Martin Hlaváček, Krzysztof Jurgiel, Jarosław Kalinowski, Elsi Katainen, Camilla Laureti, Gilles Lebreton, Julie Lechanteux, Norbert Lins, Chris MacManus, Colm Markey, Marlene Mortler, Ulrike Müller, Maria Noichl, Juozas Olekas, Eugenia Rodríguez Palop, Bronis Ropè, Bert-Jan Ruissen, Anne Sander, Petri Sarvamaa, Simone Schmiedtbauer, Annie Schreijer-Pierik, Marc Tarabella, Veronika Vrecionová, Sarah Wiener, Juan Ignacio Zoido Álvarez
Substitutes present for the final vote	Cristina Maestre Martín De Almagro, Alin Mituța

FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

35	+
ID	Mara Bizzotto, Angelo Ciocca, Ivan David, Gilles Lebreton, Julie Lechanteux
NI	Dino Giarrusso
PPE	Álvaro Amaro, Daniel Buda, Salvatore De Meo, Herbert Dorfmann, Jarosław Kalinowski, Norbert Lins, Colm Markey, Marlene Mortler, Anne Sander, Petri Sarvamaa, Simone Schmiedtbauer, Annie Schreijer-Pierik, Juan Ignacio Zoido Álvarez
Renew	Atidzhe Alieva-Veli, Asger Christensen, Jérémy Decerle, Martin Hlaváček, Elsi Katainen, Alin Mituța, Ulrike Müller
S&D	Clara Aguilera, Carmen Avram, Adrian-Dragoș Benea, Isabel Carvalhais, Paolo De Castro, Camilla Laureti, Cristina Maestre Martín De Almagro, Juozas Olekas, Marc Tarabella

9	-
S&D	Maria Noichl
The Left	Luke Ming Flanagan, Chris MacManus, Eugenia Rodríguez Palop
Verts/ALE	Benoît Biteau, Francisco Guerreiro, Martin Häusling, Bronis Ropé, Sarah Wiener

4	0
ECR	Mazaly Aguilar, Krzysztof Jurgiel, Bert-Jan Ruissen, Veronika Vrecionová

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention